



Comhairle Cathrach Chorcaí Cork City Council

Quality Assurance Report 2019

To Be Submitted to the National Oversight Audit Committee in Compliance with
the Public Spending Code

National Oversight and Audit Commission,
NOAC Secretariat,
Custom House,
Dublin 1.

31 August 2019

Dear Sir / Madam,

Re: Certification of Public Spending Code, Quality Assurance Report for Cork City Council 2019

This Quality Assurance Report reflects Cork City Council's assessment of compliance with the Public Spending Code. It is based on the best financial, organisational and performance related information available across the various areas of responsibility.

Yours faithfully,



Anne Doherty, CEO
Cork City Council

Contents

| | |
|---|-----------|
| 1. Introduction | <i>4</i> |
| 2. Expenditure Analysis | <i>5</i> |
| 3. Assessment of Compliance | <i>6</i> |
| 4. Next Steps: Quality Assurance Process | <i>9</i> |
| 5. Conclusion | <i>10</i> |

Appendix 1: Inventory of Projects and Programmes above €0.5m

Appendix 2: Checklists - Assessment of Compliance

Appendix 3: In-depth Checks

1. Introduction

Cork City Council has completed this Quality Assurance (QA) Report as part of its on-going compliance with the Public Spending Code (PSC).

The Quality Assurance procedure aims to gauge the extent to which Cork City Council is meeting the obligations set out in the Public Spending Code. The Public Spending Code ensures that the State achieves value for money in the use of all public funds.

The Quality Assurance Process contains five steps:

- 1. Drawing up Inventories of all projects/programmes at different stages of the Project Life Cycle** (appraisal, planning/design, implementation, post implementation). The three sections are expenditure being considered, expenditure being incurred and expenditure that has recently ended and the inventory includes all capital projects/programmes above €0.5m and all current expenditure as per the annual budget process above €0.5m.
- 2. Publish summary information on website of all procurements in excess of €10m, whether new, in progress or completed.**
- 3. Checklists to be completed in respect of the different stages.** These checklists allow the Council to self-assess their compliance with the code in respect of the checklists which are provided through the PSC document.
- 4. Carry out a more in-depth check on a small number of selected objects / programmes.** A number of projects or programmes are selected to be reviewed more intensively. This includes a review of all projects from ex-post to ex-ante.
- 5. Complete a short report for the Department of Public Expenditure and Reform** which includes the inventory of all projects, the website reference for the publication of procurements above €10m, the completed checklists, the Council's judgement on the adequacy of processes given the findings from the in-depth checks and proposals to remedy any discovered inadequacies.

This report fulfils the fifth requirement of the QA Process for Cork City Council for 2019. Certain projects and programmes included in the project inventory predate Circular 13/13 but were subject to prevailing guidance covering public expenditure prior to that, e.g. the Appraisal and Management of Capital Expenditure Guidelines 2005.

2. Expenditure Analysis

2.1 Inventory of Projects/Programmes

This section details the inventory drawn up by Cork City Council in accordance with the guidance on the Quality Assurance process. The inventory lists all of the Council's projects and programmes at various stages of the project life cycle which amount to more than €0.5m. This inventory is divided between current and capital projects and between three stages:

- A) Expenditure being considered
- B) Expenditure being incurred
- C) Expenditure that has recently ended

Details of the capital projects and revenue programmes included in the inventory for 2019 are set out in Appendix 1. Expenditure included under the Council's revenue programmes has been included in the same heading format as the 2019 adopted Budget approved by the Elected Members of the Council.

Summary of Project / Programme Inventory 2019

| Local Authority | Expenditure being considered | | | | | Expenditure being incurred | | | Expenditure recently ended | | | TOTAL |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|------------|-----------|-----------|----------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------|-----------|
| | Current > 10.5m | Capital Grant Schemes 10.5m | Capital | | | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes > 10.5m | Capital Projects | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes > 10.5m | Capital Projects | |
| | | | 10.5 - 15m | 15 - 120m | 120m plus | | | | | | | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Housing and Building | €10.68m | €m | €12.33m | €12.52m | €95.26m | €54.54m | €m | €326.38m | €m | €m | €61.44m | €573.15m |
| Road Transportation & Safety | €9.04m | €m | €27.55m | €82.34m | €70m | €34.21m | €m | €34.96m | €m | €m | €m | €258.1m |
| Water Services | €m | €m | €m | €m | €m | €9.93m | €m | €m | €m | €m | €m | €9.93m |
| Development Management | €1.59m | €m | €3.55m | €m | €m | €11.67m | €m | €23.8m | €m | €m | €4.06m | €44.67m |
| Environmental Services | €m | €m | €m | €10m | €m | €31.66m | €m | €26.53m | €m | €m | €m | €68.19m |
| Recreation & Amenity | €13.06m | €m | €m | €m | €5.3m | €26.6m | €m | €92m | €m | €m | €5m | €46.38m |
| Miscellaneous Services | €m | €m | €m | €m | €m | €m | €m | €72m | €m | €m | €m | €72m |
| Total | €34.36m | €m | €43.43m | €104.86m | €170.56m | €168.61m | €m | €413.32m | €m | €m | €65.99m | €1001.14m |
| Total Number of Projects/Programmes | 9 | 1 | 16 | 13 | 4 | 43 | 1 | 76 | 1 | 1 | 12 | 177 |

The full inventory can be found in **Appendix 1** of this report.

2.2 Published Summary of Procurements

As part of the Quality Assurance process Cork City Council has published summary information on our website of all procurements in excess of €10m. Listed below is the link to this publication page and an illustration of its location.

Link to Procurement Publications:

<https://www.corkcity.ie/en/council-services/public-info/spending-and-revenue/>

(Under Procurement drop down)

3. Assessment of Compliance

3.1 Checklist Completion: Approach Taken and Results

The third step in the Quality Assurance process involves completing a set of checklists covering all expenditure. The high level checks in Step 3 of the QA process are based on self-assessment by each of the Directorates and Departments within Cork City Council, in respect of guidelines set out in the Public Spending Code. There are seven checklists in total:

Checklist 1: General Obligations Not Specific to Individual Projects/Programmes

Checklist 2: Capital Projects or Capital Grant Schemes Being Considered

Checklist 3: Current Expenditure Being Considered

Checklist 4: Capital Expenditure Being Incurred

Checklist 5: Current Expenditure Being Incurred

Checklist 6: Capital Expenditure Completed

Checklist 7: Current Expenditure Completed

(a) In addition to the self-assessed scoring, the majority of answers are accompanied by explanatory comments. Each question in the checklist is judged using the following scoring mechanism:

- Scope for significant improvements = a score of 1
- Compliant but with some improvement necessary = a score of 2
- Broadly compliant = a score of 3

The set of completed checklists are set out in **Appendix 2** of this report.

3.2 Main Issues Arising from Checklist Assessment

The completed checklists show the extent to which Cork City Council believes that it complies with the Public Spending Code. They show the result of a self assessment exercise completed by the project owners within the various Directorates and Departments of the Council. Overall, the checklists show a good level of compliance with the Code.

Checklists 1, 2, 4 and 6 shows that Cork City Council broadly meets the requirements of the Public Spending Code and Quality Assurance reporting. The City Boundary Extension which came into effect on May 31st 2019 has meant Cork City Council has faced many challenges in 2019. While there continues to be a focus on compliance with the Public Spending Code, the resourcing of some of the planned training and post project reviews for 2019 has been challenging. This has been largely due to the rapid and significant expansion of services. Cork City Council is committed to providing training to all relevant staff and ensuring an increased focus is placed on post project reviews.

Current Expenditure programmes covered under checklist 3, 5 and 7 are generally covered by the Statutory Budget process which requires the approval of the elected members of the Council.

3.3 In-Depth Checks

The Council's Internal Audit function carried out the in-depth checks required under Step 4 of the Quality Assurance process. For 2019 four projects / programmes were selected, one from a Current Expenditure programme with Expenditure being Incurred and three Capital Projects also under Expenditure Being Incurred on the Project Inventory. The In-Depth Checks included covering a total of 7% of overall project/ programme costs. Details of the checks are as follows:

| In- Depth Checks 2019 | € millions |
|--|------------|
| Revenue Programme – Expenditure being Incurred | |
| Public Lighting Programme | €3.74m |
| Total Value of Revenue Programme In-depth Reviews | |
| Total Revenue Programme Inventory 2019 | €168.61m |
| % Reviewed | 2% |
| Capital Project – Expenditure Being Incurred | |
| Boyce's Street Housing Project | €17.02m |
| City Northwest Quarter Regeneration Phase 2A Housing Project | €11.85m |
| City Northwest Quarter Regeneration Phase 2B Housing Project | €10.13m |
| Total Value of Capital Projects In-depth Reviews | |
| Total Capital Project Inventory 2019 | €413.32m |
| % Reviewed | 9% |
| 2019 Overall Percentage Reviewed | |
| | 7% |

The set of completed In-Depth Check Reports are contained in **Appendix 3** of this report.

Current Expenditure Programme - Expenditure being Incurred Programme Selected:

Public Lighting

For the purpose of the in-depth checks requirement, Internal Audit chose a sample of one current expenditure programme representing. The current expenditure Programme under review is the Public Lighting Programme. The in-depth check has shown that there are robust controls and monitoring in place in relation to the operation of public lighting and that there is sufficient oversight of contractors engaged to carry out public lighting maintenance and services. There is also Value for Money being achieved on the programme as a majority of the expenditure is procured through national and local procurement frameworks. Overall the public lighting programme is broadly compliant with the relevant requirements of the public spending code, however Internal Audit have recommend that a formal detailed policy of the processes involved in managing the public lighting function be documented.

Capital Expenditure Projects Selected:

1. **Housing Capital** - Boyce's Street Housing Project (Expenditure being incurred)
2. **Housing Capital** – City Northwest Quarter Regeneration Phase 2A Housing Project (Expenditure being incurred)
3. **Housing Capital** – City Northwest Quarter Regeneration Phase 2B Housing Project (Expenditure being incurred)

For the purpose of the in-depth checks requirement, Internal Audit chose a sample of three capital expenditure programme.

The ***Boyce's Street project*** involves the development of fifty-one dwelling units in Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street, Cork with an approved overall budget of €17,019,856.42. The in-depth review found the application process is aligned and consistent with the requirements of the Public Spending Code, the Capital Works Management Framework, Public Financial Procedures and EU and National Procurement Requirements. Overall, the capital expenditure project being incurred – Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street Development Project is well managed and it is reasonable to conclude that Cork City Council is in compliance with the Public Spending Code.

The ***City Northwest Quarter Regeneration Phase 2A Housing Project*** involves the development of 47 dwelling units in Knocknaheeny, Cork with an approved overall budget of €11,852,988.31. The site was demolished and redeveloped. An application for capital funding for the project was made to the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government and progressed through each stage. The in-depth review reports that the application process is aligned and consistent with the requirements of the Public Spending Code, the Capital Works Management Framework, Public Financial Procedures and EU and National Procurement Requirements. Overall the CNWQR Phase 2A Development Project is well managed and it is reasonable to conclude that Cork City Council is in compliance with the Public Spending Code.

The ***City Northwest Quarter Regeneration Phase 2B Housing Project*** involves the development of 38 dwelling units in Knocknaheeny, Cork with an approved overall budget of €10,125,873.52. An application for capital funding for the project was made to the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government. The in-depth review reports that the application process is aligned and consistent with the requirements of the Public Spending Code, the Capital Works Management Framework, Public Financial Procedures and EU and National Procurement Requirements. Overall, the capital expenditure project being incurred – CNWQR Phase 2B Development Project is well managed and it is reasonable to conclude that Cork City Council is in compliance with the Public Spending Code.

All in-depth capital project reviews recommend that post-project reviews should be completed within a reasonable timeframe once the project is complete. Internal audit also recommends that staff is made aware or refreshed of the principles and procedures of the Public Spending Code and the importance of compliance with the Code particularly in light of the movement and transfer of staff arising from the boundary extension of Cork City Council in May 2019.

4. Next Steps: Quality Assurance Process

Cork City Council has operated in broad compliance with the requirements of the Public Spending Code in 2019, borne out by the checklists completed by the project owners and the in-depth reviews carried out by Internal Audit. Lessons learned over the last number of years show that continuous communication of the requirements of the public spending code is key to both maintaining this level and making the improvements necessary. The experience gained by staff in completing this quality assurance process and ongoing capital budget controls all support the keeping of PSC requirements in the day to day priorities of Council staff.

A new directorate 'Infrastructure Development' has been established to centralise the management, design, tender and delivery of capital projects for Roads, Parks, Recreation, LIAF and Flood Defence in the City. This centralised management of capital projects will further assist with the embedding of best practice in project management implement the PSC requirements and will promote corporate learning from past experiences. All Housing Capital delivery remains with Housing Directorate due to its strategic importance.

Cork City Council is committed to providing ongoing internal training in relation to areas such as procurement, capital management and delivery and 2020.

5. Conclusion

The inventory outlined in this report lists the capital expenditure that is being considered, being incurred, and that has recently ended. Cork City Council has published details of all procurements in excess of €10 million on its website. The checklists completed by the organisation show a satisfactory level of compliance with the Public Spending Code. The in-depth checks carried out on a selection of programmes revealed no major issues which would cast doubt on the Council's compliance with the Code. However the Quality Assurance Process has identified areas where the Council can improve both at a broad level in implementing the Code and in specific areas across all three expenditure categories. Cork City Council has faced many changes in 2019 due to the expansion of the city; this has afforded the opportunity to roll out further training and awareness to existing and new staff and this knowledge sharing will continue to be priority for 2020.

The main areas of improvement identified in this report will be incorporated to enhance its reporting and ensure high levels of compliance with the PSC in the future.

Appendix 1

Inventory of Projects and Programmes above €0.5m

| Local Authority | Expenditure being considered | | | | | Expenditure being incurred | | | Expenditure recently ended | | | |
|---|------------------------------|-------------------------------------|---------------------|-----------|-----------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|--------|
| | Current > €0.5m | Capital Grant Schemes > €0.5m | Capital Projects | | | > €0.5m | | | > €0.5m | | | |
| | | | €0.5 - €5m | €5 - €20m | €20m plus | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Housing & Building | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| CNWR SOCIAL & COMMUNITY | | | | | | | | €9m | | | | |
| CNWR CORK NORTH WEST REGENERATION PROJECT | | | | | | | | €12.49m | | | | |
| CNWR PHASE 1B DEVT. (PROJECT 4-7) | | | | | | | | | | | | €9.49m |
| CNWR PH. 2A (DECANT/ENABLING) | | | | | | | | | | | | €1.02m |
| CNWQR PH 2A DESIGN & CONSTRUCT | | | | | | | | €11.85m | | | | |
| CNWQR PH 2B DECANT & ENABLING | | | | | | | | €10.13m | | | | |
| CNWQR PHASE 1C | | | | | | | | €10.55m | | | | |
| CNWQR PHASE 2C (previously PHASE 1E) | | | | | | | | €6.58m | | | | |
| CNWQR PHASE 3B | | | | | | | | €16.13m | | | | |
| CNWQR PH 3 DECANT & ENABLING | | | | | | | | €1.74m | | | | |
| SHP 2015 - 17 - CORCORAN'S QUAY | | | | | | | | €0.71m | | | | |
| SHP 2015 - 17 - 5 UNITS FARRANFERRIS CRESCENT | | | | | | | | €1.22m | | | | |
| SHP 2015 -17 - 5 UNITS ARD AOIBHINN BANDUFF - | | | | | | | | €1.27m | | | | |
| SHP 2015 -17 - 30 UNITS ARUS MHUIRE BLACKROCK | | | | | | | | €7.73m | | | | |
| SHP 2015 -17 - 32 UNITS BARRACK STREET | | | | | | | | €9.39m | | | | |
| SHP 2015 -17 - 43 UNITS CHURCH ROAD BLACKROCK | | | | | | | | €11.99m | | | | |
| SHP 2015 -17 - 10 UNITS HIGH STREET | | | | | | | | €2.56m | | | | |
| SHP 2015 -17 - 4 UNITS TRAMORE ROAD | | | | | | | | €1.13m | | | | |
| SHP 2015 -17 - 46 UNITS WHITE STREET | | | | | | | | €12.7m | | | | |
| SHP 2015 -17 - 16 UNITS WOOD STREET | | | | | | | | €4.63m | | | | |

| Local Authority | Expenditure being considered | | | | | Expenditure being incurred | | | Expenditure recently ended | | | |
|---|------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------|-----------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|---------|
| | Current > €0.5m | Capital Grant Schemes > €0.5m | Capital Capital Projects | | | > €0.5m | | | > €0.5m | | | |
| | | | €0.5 - €5m | €5 - €20m | €20m plus | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| SHP 2015 -17 25 UNITS BLARNEY STREET | | | | | | | | €7.11m | | | | |
| PROJECTS TO BE DEVELOPED UNDER THE Social Housing Strategy - SHP 2017 - 19 | | | | | | €95.26m | | | | | | |
| SHP 2017 - 2019 - 17 UNITS - 29/30 LOWER JOHN ST | | | | | | | | €4.79m | | | | |
| SHP 2017 - 2019 - 5 UNITS - BALLINURE RD | | | | | | | | €1.39m | | | | |
| SHP 2017 - 2019 - 5 UNITS - MOSS LANE, RIVERWAY | | | | | | | | €1.58m | | | | |
| SHP 2017 - 2019 - 7-11 GERALD GRIFFIN STREET | | | | | | | | €3.91m | | | | |
| OLD WHITECHURCH RD INFRASTRUCTURE | | | | | | | | €9.9m | | | | |
| REFURB DEANROCK-TOGHER | | | | | | | | | | | | €1.19m |
| DEANROCK CONSTRUCTION | | | | | | | | €17.23m | | | | |
| 5/6 SHANDON STREET | | | | | | | | €3.94m | | | | |
| CHURCHFIELD PLACE EAST | | | | | | | | €0.75m | | | | |
| 50 UNITS BOYCES STREET | | | | | | | | €17.02m | | | | |
| 67/68 ST. JOHN'S WELL | | | | | | | | €1.67m | | | | |
| 40 UNITS GERALD GRIFFIN ST | | | | | | | | €18.35m | | | | |
| ERRIGAL HEIGHTS, THE GLEN | | | | | | | | €7.62m | | | | |
| SOCIAL HOUSING ACQUISITIONS | | | €4.m | | | | | €22.7m | | | | €35.65m |
| VOID RECOVERY PROGRAMME 2017 | | | | | | | | | | | | €2.73m |
| VOID RECOVERY PROGRAMME 2019 | | | | | | | | €6.54m | | | | |
| VOID RECOVERY PROGRAMME 2020 | | | | | €0.75m | | | | | | | |
| HOUSING VOIDS PROGRAMME 2016 | | | | | | | | | | | | €6.m |
| REVOLVING FUND VACANT HSE. REP | | | | | | | | €0.76m | | | | |
| HOUSE PURCH 27 UNITS ELDERWOOD | | | | | | | | €4.96m | | | | |
| REDCLYFFE | | | | | | | | | | | | €3.26m |
| 4 UNITS WYCHERLEY PLACE | | | €1.17m | | | | | | | | | |
| SOC HSG - BESSBOROUGH RD SITE | | | | | | | | | | | | €2.09m |

| Local Authority | Expenditure being considered | | | | | Expenditure being incurred | | | Expenditure recently ended | | | |
|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------|-----------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|--|
| | Current > €0.5m | Capital Grant Schemes > €0.5m | Capital Capital Projects | | | > €0.5m | | | > €0.5m | | | |
| | | | €0.5 - €5m | €5 - €20m | €20m plus | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| SOC HSG - MODEL FARM RD SITE | | | | | | | | €1.87m | | | | |
| BRAMBLE COTTAGES, POPHAMS RD | | | | | | | | €1.31m | | | | |
| RESPOND ST. VINCENTS CONVENT | | | | | | | | €4.4m | | | | |
| RESPOND THOMAS DAVIS ST | | | | | | | | €2.5m | | | | |
| ROOF REPAIRS | | | | | | | | €1.5m | | | | |
| ROOFLINE REPAIRS | | | | | | | | €3.06m | | | | |
| CENTRAL HEATING INSTALLATION | | | | | | | | €1.05m | | | | |
| WINDOWS & DOORS | | | | | | | | €1.89m | | | | |
| FAIRFIELD MEADOW REMEDIATION | | | | | | | | €1.65m | | | | |
| TAKING IN CHARGE | | | | | | | | €1.35m | | | | |
| STOCK CONDITION SURVEY | | | | | | | | €0.5m | | | | |
| HOLLYWOOD ESTATE INFILL HSG | | | | | | | | €1.91m | | | | |
| COMP DIALOGUE - SPRING LANE | | | €2.65m | | | | | | | | | |
| COMP DIALOGUE - GLEN RYAN RD | | | €2.98m | | | | | | | | | |
| COMP DIALOGUE - SHANAKIEL RD | | | | €6.27m | | | | | | | | |
| COMP DIALOGUE - COACH STREET | | | | | | | | €3.83m | | | | |
| COMP DIALOGUE - SKEHARD RD, | | | | €5.5m | | | | | | | | |
| 2 UNITS FOYLE AVE-INFILL | | | | | | | | €0.95m | | | | |
| WESTSIDE | | | | | | | | €10.19m | | | | |
| CLOVERHILL COURT | | | | | | | | €15.56m | | | | |
| POULAVONE | | | | | | | | €16.91m | | | | |
| MADONNA HOUSE (PHASE 2) | | | €1.53m | | | | | | | | | |
| GLENAMOY LAWN, MAYFIELD | | | | | | | | €0.79m | | | | |
| FARRANREE | | | | | | | | €1.22m | | | | |
| A01 MAINT/IMP LA HOUSING UNITS | | | | | | | €16.58m | | | | | |
| A02 HOUSING ASSESS, ALLOC & TRANSFER | | | | | | | €0.87m | | | | | |

| Local Authority | Expenditure being considered | | | | | Expenditure being incurred | | | Expenditure recently ended | | |
|--|------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------|----------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|
| | Current > €0.5m | Capital Grant Schemes > €0.5m | Capital Capital Projects | | | > €0.5m | | | > €0.5m | | |
| | | | €0.5 - €5m | €5 - €20m | €20m plus | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | |
| A04 HOUSING COMM DEVELOP SUPPORT | | | | | | €6.27m | | | | | |
| A05 ADMIN OF HOMELESS SERVICE | €6.27m | | | | | €13.65m | | | | | |
| A06 SUPPORT TO HOUSING CAPITAL PRO | | | | | | €2.38m | | | | | |
| A07 RAS PROGRAMME | €3.7m | | | | | €10.97m | | | | | |
| A08 HOUSING LOANS | | | | | | €0.96m | | | | | |
| A09 Housing GRANTS | €0.7m | | | | | €2.26m | | | | | |
| A11 AGENCY & RECOUPABLE SERVICES | | | | | | €0.6m | | | | | |
| TOTAL HOUSING & BUILDING | €10.68m | €0.0m | €12.33m | €12.52m | €95.26m | €54.54m | €0.0m | €326.38m | €0.0m | €0.0m | €61.44m |
| Road Transportation and Safety | | | | | | | | | | | |
| McCurtain St Public Transport Improvements | | | | €8.0m | | | | | | | |
| BALLYBRACK CYCLEWAY PAHSE 4 | | | €3.0m | | | | | | | | |
| CITY CENTRE MANAGEMENT PLAN | | | | | | | | €5.5m | | | |
| THOMAS DAVIS BRIDGE JUNCTION | | | | | | | | €0.55m | | | |
| CURAHEEN TO CARRIGROHAN PATH UPGRADE | | | €0.75m | | | | | | | | |
| SKEHARD RD PAHSE 3 | | | €2.7m | | | | | | | | |
| BALLYVOLANE PH 2 FOX & HOUNDS | | | €3.0m | | | | | | | | |
| GLANMIRE ROADS IMPRVMT SCHEME | | | | €19.0m | | | | | | | |
| GRANGE RD TO TRAMORE VALLEY PARK(TVP) | | | | €5.0m | | | | | | | |
| HARBOUR VIEW ROAD | | | €0.8m | | | | | | | | |
| PEDESTRIAN SAFETY INTERVENTION | | | | | | | | €0.84m | | | |
| VMS PROJECT | | | | | | | | €0.6m | | | |
| SOUTH QUAYS PUBLIC TRANSPORT IMPRVMT | | | | €8.0m | | | | | | | |
| Harley Street Bridge | | | | | | | | €5.4m | | | |
| Lower Glanmire Rd Repavment Contract | | | | | | | | €2.7m | | | |
| St. Patrick's Bridge Rehabilitation | | | | | | | | €2.2m | | | |

| Local Authority | Expenditure being considered | | | | | Expenditure being incurred | | | Expenditure recently ended | | |
|---|------------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------------|------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------|------------|
| | Current > €0.5m | Capital Grant Schemes > €0.5m | Capital | | | > €0.5m | | | > €0.5m | | |
| | | | Capital Projects | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects | | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | €0.5m | €0.5 - €5m | €5 - €20m | €20m plus | | | | | | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Daly's Bridge Rehabilitation | | | | | | | | €2.5m | | | |
| Blackrock Harbour Remediation | | | | | | | | €2.8m | | | |
| Kent Station to City Centre Phase 2 | | | | | | | | €2.2m | | | |
| Ballyvolane to City Centre Cycle | | | | | | | | €1.87m | | | |
| VBLACKROCK GREENWAY ENHANCEMENT PROJECT | | | €4.3m | | | | | | | | |
| Skehard Rd-Church Rd Junction | | | | | | | | €4.7m | | | |
| Mahon Point Bus Gate & Walkway | | | | | | | | €.9m | | | |
| Docklands to City Centre Road Network | | | | €8.5m | | | | | | | |
| Monahans Road Extension | | | | €5.m | | | | | | | |
| Wilton Corridor Phase 1 (Dennehy's Cross) | | | €4.m | | | | | | | | |
| Wilton Corridor Phase 2 | | | | €15.m | | | | | | | |
| PASSAGE WEST GREENWAY PROJECT | | | €4.m | | | | | | | | |
| Eastern Gateway Bridge Docklands | | | | | €70.m | | | | | | |
| Regen - Beamish and Crawford | | | | €13.84m | | | | | | | |
| N40 SARSFIELD RD SUP WORKS | | | | | | | | €2.2m | | | |
| CURAHEEN ROAD BRIDGE REPLACE | | | €5.m | | | | | | | | |
| B01 NP ROAD - MAINTENANCE & IMPROVEMENT | | | | | | €2.7m | | | | | |
| B03 REGIONAL ROAD - MAIN&IMPROVE | | | | | | €1.01m | | | | | |
| B04 LOCAL ROAD - MAIN&IMPROVE | €7.57m | | | | | €13.48m | | | | | |
| B05 PUBLIC LIGHTING | €1.47m | | | | | €3.74m | | | | | |
| B06 TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT IMPROVE | | | | | | €5.71m | | | | | |
| B08 ROAD SAFETY PROMO/EDUCATION | | | | | | €.92m | | | | | |
| B09 CAR PARKING | | | | | | €5.24m | | | | | |
| B10 SUPPORT TO ROADS CAPITAL PROG | | | | | | €1.4m | | | | | |
| TOTAL Road Transportation and Safety | €9.04m | €.m | €27.55m | €82.34m | €70.m | €34.21m | €.m | €34.96m | €.m | €.m | €.m |

| Local Authority | Expenditure being considered | | | | | Expenditure being incurred | | | Expenditure recently ended | | | |
|---|------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------|-----------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|--------|
| | Current > €0.5m | Capital Grant Schemes > €0.5m | Capital Capital Projects | | | > €0.5m | | | > €0.5m | | | |
| | | | €0.5 - €5m | €5 - €20m | €20m plus | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Water Services | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| C01 WATER SUPPLY | | | | | | €6.61m | | | | | | |
| C02 WASTE WATER TREATMENT | | | | | | €3.32m | | | | | | |
| TOTAL WATER SERVICES | €.m | €.m | €.m | €.m | €.m | €9.93m | €.m | €.m | €.m | €.m | €.m | €.m |
| Development Management | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| CPO SCOTCH FARM LANDS | | | €3.m | | | | | | | | | |
| EVENTS CENTRE | | | | | | | | €21.5m | | | | |
| INCHIGAGGIN HOUSE & LANDS | | | | | | | | | | | | €2.81m |
| KYRLS QUAY/CORNMARKET | | | | | | | | €2.3m | | | | |
| 8&9 PARNELL PLACE | | | | | | | | | | | | €1.25m |
| CITY HALL ROOF REMEDIAL WORKS | | | €.55m | | | | | | | | | |
| D01 FORWARD PLANNING | | | | | | €1.44m | | | | | | |
| D02 DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT | | | | | | €2.4m | | | | | | |
| D03 ENFORCEMENT | €.95m | | | | | €.65m | | | | | | |
| D05 TOURISM DEVELOPMENT&PROMOTION | €.64m | | | | | €.64m | | | | | | |
| D06 COMMUNITY&ENTERPRISE FUNCTION | | | | | | €3.49m | | | | | | |
| D09 ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT&PROMOTION | | | | | | €2.43m | | | | | | |
| D11 HERITAGE&CONSERVATION SERVICES | | | | | | €.62m | | | | | | |
| TOTAL DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT | €1.59m | €.m | €3.55m | €.m | €.m | €11.67m | €.m | €23.8m | €.m | €.m | €4.06m | |
| Environmental Services | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| MORRISONS ISL PUB REALM & FLOOD DEFENCE | | | | | | | | €9.68m | | | | |
| DOUGLAS FLOOD RELIEF SCHEME | | | | | | | | €16.m | | | | |
| GLASHABOY FLOOD RELIEF SCHEME | | | | €10.m | | | | | | | | |

| Local Authority | Expenditure being considered | | | | | Expenditure being incurred | | | Expenditure recently ended | | | |
|---|------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------|-----------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------|-------|
| | Current > €0.5m | Capital Grant Schemes > €0.5m | Capital Capital Projects | | | > €0.5m | | | > €0.5m | | | |
| | | | €0.5 - €5m | €5 - €20m | €20m plus | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| ELECTRICITY GEN. AT KINSALE RD | | | | | | | | €0.85m | | | | |
| E01 LANDFILL OPERATION & AFTERCARE | | | | | | €2.03m | | | | | | |
| E02 RECOVERY&RECYC FACILITIES OPS | | | | | | €1.3m | | | | | | |
| E06 STREET CLEANING | | | | | | €7.5m | | | | | | |
| E08 WASTE MANAGEMENT PLANNING | | | | | | €5.57m | | | | | | |
| E09 MAINTENANCE OF BURIAL GROUNDS | | | | | | €1.48m | | | | | | |
| E10 SAFETY OF STRUCTURES & PLACES | | | | | | €0.74m | | | | | | |
| E11 OPERATION OF FIRE SERVICE | | | | | | €16.39m | | | | | | |
| E12 FIRE PREVENTION | | | | | | €1.65m | | | | | | |
| TOTAL ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES | €0.m | €0.m | €0.m | €10.m | €0.m | €31.66m | €0.m | €26.53m | €0.m | €0.m | €0.m | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Recreation and Amenity | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| DEVELOPMENT OF MARINA PARK | | | | | €5.3m | | | | | | | |
| TRAMORE VALLEY PARK | | | | | | | | €0.92m | | | | |
| MONAHAN RD ENVIRON ENHANCEMENT | | | 1.1m | | | | | | | | | |
| RELOCATE PITCH AT TANKFIELD | | | | | | | | | | | | €0.5m |
| F01 LEISURE FACILITIES OPERATIONS | | | | | | €1.23m | | | | | | |
| F02 OP OF LIBRARY&ARCHIVE SERVICE | | | | | | €8.09m | | | | | | |
| F03 OUTDOOR LEISURE AREA OPERATION | | | | | | €9.81m | | | | | | |
| F04 COMM,SPORT&REC DEVELOPMENT | | | | | | €1.38m | | | | | | |
| F05 OPERATION OF ARTS PROGRAMME | | | | | | €3.01m | | | | | | |
| Agriculture, Education, Health and Welfare | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| H05 OP OF MORGUE&CORONER EXP | | | | | | €0.8m | | | | | | |
| H09 LOCAL REPRES/CIVIC LEADERSHIP | | | | | | €1.4m | | | | | | |
| H11 AGENCY & RECOUPABLE SERVICES | €13.06m | | | | | €0.88m | | | | | | |
| TOTAL RECREATION & AMENITY | €13.06m | €0.m | €0.m | €0.m | €5.3m | €26.6m | €0.m | €0.92m | €0.m | €0.m | €0.5m | |

| Local Authority | Expenditure being considered | | | | | Expenditure being incurred | | | Expenditure recently ended | | |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------|-----------|-------|----------------------------|-----------------------|------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------|------------------|
| | Current | Capital | | | | > €0.5m | | | > €0.5m | | |
| | > €0.5m | Capital Grant Schemes > €0.5m | Capital Projects | | | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects | Current Expenditure | Capital Grant Schemes | Capital Projects |
| | | €0.5 - €5m | €5 - €20m | €20m plus | | | | | | | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | |
| CORK CITY COUNCIL | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Miscellaneous Services | | | | | | | | | | | |
| CRM INITIATIVE | | | | | | | | €0.72m | | | |
| TOTAL MISCELLANEOUS SERVICES | €0.0m | €0.0m | €0.0m | €0.0m | €0.0m | €0.0m | €0.0m | €0.72m | €0.0m | €0.0m | €0.0m |

Appendix 2

Checklists – Assessment of Compliance

Checklist 1 – To be completed in respect of general obligations not specific to individual projects/programmes

| General Obligations not specific to individual projects/ programmes | Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3 | Discussion/Action Required |
|---|---|---|
| 1.1 Does the local authority ensure, on an on-going basis, that appropriate people within the authority and its agencies are aware of the requirements of the Public Spending Code (incl. through training)? | 3 | Cork City Council has procedures in place to ensure relevant staffs are aware of PSC requirements. |
| 1.2 Has training on the Public Spending Code been provided to relevant staff within the authority? | 3 | Cork City Council has provided training to relevant staff and will Endeavour to ensure all new staff receive training. |
| 1.3 Has the Public Spending Code been adapted for the type of project/programme that your local authority is responsible for? i.e., have adapted sectoral guidelines been developed? | 3 | Yes |
| 1.4 Has the local authority in its role as Sanctioning Authority satisfied itself that agencies that it funds comply with the Public Spending Code? | N/A | N/A |
| 1.5 Have recommendations from previous QA reports (incl. spot checks) been disseminated, where appropriate, within the local authority and to agencies? | 3 | All recommendations form part of the overall internal audit tracker. |
| 1.6 Have recommendations from previous QA reports been acted upon? | 2 | Recommendations form part of the overall internal audit tracker and are applied to new projects but not retrospectively. |
| 1.7 Has an annual Public Spending Code QA report been certified by the local authority's Chief Executive, submitted to NOAC and published on the authority's website? | 3 | Yes |
| 1.8 Was the required sample of projects/programmes subjected to in-depth checking as per step 4 of the QAP? | 3 | Yes, there were 3 projects and one programme subject to in-depth checking. |
| 1.9 Is there a process in place to plan for ex post evaluations/Post Project Reviews? Ex-post evaluation is conducted after a certain period has passed since the completion of a target project with emphasis on the effectiveness and sustainability of the project. | 2 | There is a process for Post Project reviews. Often Sanctioning authorities require a post project review and these are submitted accordingly. |

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| 1.10 How many formal Post Project Review evaluations have been completed in the year under review? Have they been issued promptly to the relevant stakeholders / published in a timely manner? | 2 | One post project review completed by year end (infrastructure). |
| 1.11 Is there a process to follow up on the recommendations of previous evaluations/Post project reviews? | 3 | Yes Internal Audit track and follow up recommendations from previous evaluations and post project reviews. |
| 1.12 How have the recommendations of previous evaluations / post project reviews informed resource allocation decisions? | 2 | Resource allocation decisions are based informally on recommendations |

Checklist 2 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grant schemes that were under consideration in the past year

| Capital Expenditure being Considered – Appraisal and Approval | Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3 | Comment/Action Required |
|--|--|--|
| 2.1 Was a preliminary appraisal undertaken for all projects > €5m? | 3 | Preliminary Appraisals are required for all capital projects |
| 2.2 Was an appropriate appraisal method used in respect of capital projects or capital programmes/grant schemes? | 3 | Some projects (being considered) in the inventory were still in the early stages of appraisal. |
| 2.3 Was a CBA/CEA completed for all projects exceeding €20m? | 3 | Yes |
| 2.4 Was the appraisal process commenced at an early stage to facilitate decision making? (i.e. prior to the decision) | 3 | Yes. An appraisal process must be completed before budgets are allocated. Controlled centrally by Finance. |
| 2.5 Was an Approval in Principle granted by the Sanctioning Authority for all projects before they entered the planning and design phase (e.g. procurement)? | 3 | Yes – appraisal process must be completed before budgets are completed. |
| 2.6 If a CBA/CEA was required was it submitted to the relevant Department for their views? | 3 | Yes as required |
| 2.7 Were the NDFA consulted for projects costing more than €20m? | N/A | Not applicable |
| 2.8 Were all projects that went forward for tender in line with the Approval in Principle and, if not, was the detailed appraisal revisited and a fresh Approval in Principle granted? | 3 | Broadly Compliant |
| 2.9 Was approval granted to proceed to tender? | 3 | Yes |
| 2.10 Were procurement rules complied with? | 3 | Yes |
| 2.11 Were State Aid rules checked for all supports? | 3 | Yes where applicable |
| 2.12 Were the tenders received in line with the Approval in Principle in terms of cost and what is expected to be delivered? | 3 | Yes |
| 2.13 Were performance indicators specified for each project/programme that will allow for a robust evaluation at a later date? | 3 | Broadly compliant but further emphasis required |
| 2.14 Have steps been put in place to gather performance indicator data? | 2 | Some progress made but further training required. |

Checklist 3 – To be completed in respect of new current expenditure under consideration in the past year

| Current Expenditure being Considered – Appraisal and Approval | Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3 | Comment/Action Required |
|---|---|--|
| 3.1 Were objectives clearly set out? | 3 | Set out in the Annual Service Delivery Plan & Budget Process. |
| 3.2 Are objectives measurable in quantitative terms? | 3 | National and local Service Level Indicators in place and are reviewed regularly. |
| 3.3 Was a business case, incorporating financial and economic appraisal, prepared for new current expenditure? | 3 | This is considered as part of Annual Statutory Budgetary Process. |
| 3.4 Was an appropriate appraisal method used? | 3 | Appraised based on competing priorities in Budgetary Process |
| 3.5 Was an economic appraisal completed for all projects exceeding €20m or an annual spend of €5m over 4 years? | N/A | Not applicable |
| 3.6 Did the business case include a section on piloting? | N/A | Not applicable |
| 3.7 Were pilots undertaken for new current spending proposals involving total expenditure of at least €20m over the proposed duration of the programme and a minimum annual expenditure of €5m? | N/A | Not applicable |
| 3.8 Have the methodology and data collection requirements for the pilot been agreed at the outset of the scheme? | N/A | Not applicable |
| 3.9 Was the pilot formally evaluated and submitted for approval to the relevant Department? | N/A | Not applicable |
| 3.10 Has an assessment of likely demand for the new scheme/scheme extension been estimated based on empirical evidence? | Yes | This is considered as part of Annual Statutory Budgetary Process |

| | | |
|---|-----|--|
| 3.11 Was the required approval granted? | Yes | Yes, approved by Council under statutory Annual Budget Process. |
| 3.12 Has a sunset clause (as defined in section B06, 4.2 of the Public Spending Code) been set? | N/A | Not applicable |
| 3.13 If outsourcing was involved were procurement rules complied with? | N/A | Not applicable |
| 3.14 Were performance indicators specified for each new current expenditure proposal or expansion of existing current expenditure programme which will allow for a robust evaluation at a later date? | Yes | This is considered as part of Annual Statutory Budgetary Process |
| 3.15 Have steps been put in place to gather performance indicator data? | Yes | National and local Service Level Indicators in place and are reviewed regularly. |

Checklist 4 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grants schemes incurring expenditure in the year under review

| Incurring Capital Expenditure | Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3 | Comment/Action Required |
|--|---|--|
| 4.1 Was a contract signed and was it in line with the Approval in Principle? | 3 | Yes |
| 4.2 Did management boards/steering committees meet regularly as agreed? | 3 | Yes |
| 4.3 Were programme co-ordinators appointed to co-ordinate implementation? | 3 | Yes, staff at the appropriate level were given responsibility for specific projects. |
| 4.4 Were project managers, responsible for delivery, appointed and were the project managers at a suitably senior level for the scale of the project? | 3 | Yes, project managers were appointed appropriate to scale of project. |
| 4.5 Were monitoring reports prepared regularly, showing implementation against plan, budget, timescales and quality? | 3 | Yes, financial management information was readily available. Budget vs. Actual and timelines monitored regularly. Quality checks were carried out where practical. |
| 4.6 Did projects/programmes/grant schemes keep within their financial budget and time schedule? | 3 | For the most part however scope changes & contractual issues resulted in time/financial implications for specific projects. |
| 4.7 Did budgets have to be adjusted? | 2 | In Exceptional Cases |
| 4.8 Were decisions on changes to budgets / time schedules made promptly? | 3 | Yes where necessary |
| 4.9 Did circumstances ever warrant questioning the viability of the project/programme/grant scheme and the business case incl. CBA/CEA? (exceeding budget, lack of progress, changes in the environment, new evidence, etc.) | 3 | In Exceptional Cases |
| 4.10 If circumstances did warrant questioning the viability of a project/programme/grant scheme, was the project subjected to | 3 | Yes where necessary |

| | | |
|---|---|---------------------------------------|
| adequate examination? | | |
| 4.11 If costs increased was approval received from the Sanctioning Authority? | 3 | Yes, approval sought where necessary. |
| 4.12 Were any projects/programmes/grant schemes terminated because of deviations from the plan, the budget or because circumstances in the environment changed the need for the investment? | 3 | No, this did not occur. |

Checklist 5 – To be completed in respect of current expenditure programmes incurring expenditure in the year under review

| Incurring Current Expenditure | Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 -3 | Comment/Action Required |
|--|---------------------------------------|---|
| 5.1 Are there clear objectives for all areas of current expenditure? | 3 | Yes. Spending Programme Defined as part of the Annual Budget process which is in line with the Corporate Plan and Service Delivery Plans. |
| 5.2 Are outputs well defined? | 2 | National KPIs are in place for Local Government. Cork City Council also has local indicators in place. |
| 5.3 Are outputs quantified on a regular basis? | 2 | National Service Level Indicators (KPIs) are established annually for specific services. Monthly KPI reports are submitted to Council. |
| 5.4 Is there a method for monitoring efficiency on an on-going basis? | 2 | Annual reporting on National Service Level indicators. Monthly national and local KPIs reported to Council. |
| 5.5 Are outcomes well defined? | 2 | Well defined for certain Programmes, more subjective for others. Targets are defined in the Annual Budget, Corporate Plan and Service Delivery Plans. |
| 5.6 Are outcomes quantified on a regular basis? | 2 | Yes for major Current Expenditure Programmes. Annual budgets and SPC reporting. |
| 5.7 Are unit costings compiled for performance monitoring? | 2 | Unit costing where appropriate. |
| 5.8 Are other data compiled to monitor performance? | 2 | Yes for internal reporting purposes. |
| 5.9 Is there a method for monitoring effectiveness on an on-going basis? | 2 | There is a method for certain programmes. |

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| 5.10 Has the organisation engaged in any other 'evaluation proofing' ¹ of programmes/projects? | 1 | There has been no formal 'evaluation proofing' however data is available to allow for future evaluation. |
|---|---|--|

¹ Evaluation proofing involves checking to see if the required data is being collected so that when the time comes a programme/project can be subjected to a robust evaluation. If the data is not being collected, then a plan should be put in place to collect the appropriate indicators to allow for the completion of a robust evaluation down the line.

Checklist 6 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grant schemes discontinued and/or evaluated during the year under review

| Capital Expenditure Recently Completed | Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3 | Comment/Action Required |
|---|---|---|
| 6.1 How many post project reviews were completed in the year under review? | 2 | There was one post project reviews completed. |
| 6.2 Was a post project review completed for all projects/programmes exceeding €20m? | N/A | |
| 6.3 Was a post project review completed for all capital grant schemes where the scheme both (1) had an annual value in excess of €30m and (2) where scheme duration was five years or more? | N/A | |
| 6.4 Aside from projects over €20m and grant schemes over €30m, was the requirement to review 5% (Value) of all other projects adhered to? | 3 | YES |
| 6.5 If sufficient time has not elapsed to allow for a proper assessment, has a post project review been scheduled for a future date? | 2 | Yes, post project reviews are scheduled. |
| 6.6 Were lessons learned from post-project reviews disseminated within the Sponsoring Agency and to the Sanctioning Authority? (Or other relevant bodies) | 2 | Yes, it is a requirement of some sanctioning authorities to complete a 'lessons learned'. |
| 6.7 Were changes made to practices in light of lessons learned from post-project reviews? | 2 | Lessons learned were taken into consideration. |
| 6.8 Were project reviews carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation? | 1 | Generally no due to resources. |

Checklist 7 – To be completed in respect of current expenditure programmes that reached the end of their planned timeframe during the year or were discontinued

| Current Expenditure that (i) reached the end of its planned timeframe or (ii) was discontinued | Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3 | Comment/Action Required |
|---|---|--------------------------------|
| 7.1 Were reviews carried out of current expenditure programmes that matured during the year or were discontinued? | N/A | No such programmes in 2019 |
| 7.2 Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were efficient? | N/A | No such programmes in 2019 |
| 7.3 Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were effective? | N/A | No such programmes in 2019 |
| 7.4 Have the conclusions reached been taken into account in related areas of expenditure? | N/A | No such programmes in 2019 |
| 7.5 Were any programmes discontinued following a review of a current expenditure programme? | N/A | No such programmes in 2019 |
| 7.6 Were reviews carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation? | N/A | No such programmes in 2019 |
| 7.7 Were changes made to the organisation’s practices in light of lessons learned from reviews? | N/A | No such programmes in 2019 |

Notes:

- ❖ The scoring mechanism for the above checklists is as follows:
 - Scope for significant improvements = a score of 1
 - Compliant but with some improvement necessary = a score of 2
 - Broadly compliant = a score of 3

- ❖ For some questions, the scoring mechanism is not always strictly relevant. In these cases, it is appropriate to mark as N/A and provide the required information in the commentary box as appropriate.

- ❖ The focus should be on providing descriptive and contextual information to frame the compliance ratings and to address the issues raised for each question. It is also important to provide summary details of key analytical outputs covered in the sample for those questions which address compliance with appraisal/evaluation requirements i.e. the annual number of appraisals (e.g. Cost Benefit Analyses or Multi Criteria Analyses), evaluations (e.g. Post Project Reviews). Key analytical outputs undertaken but outside of the sample should also be noted in the report.

Appendix 3

In-Depth Checks Detailed Reports 2019

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme or Project Information

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Name | Boyce's Street Housing Project |
| Detail | Capital investment programme to develop social housing units in Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street, Cork. |
| Responsible Body | Cork City Council |
| Current Status | Expenditure being incurred |
| Start Date | September 2016 |
| End Date | Expected Completion Date of November 2022 |
| Overall Cost | €17,019,856.42 |

Project Description

The project is for the development of fifty-one dwellings, with a mix of 1 bedroom, 2 bedroom and 3 bedroom units at Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street, Cork. The objective is to address the poor quality of housing and public open space in the Boyce's Street area/Upper Cattle Market Street area. Through discussion with the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government (DHPLG) Architectural Inspectorate it was decided that the optimum solution was to demolish the existing dwellings and to redevelop the site to its full potential to maximise density. It is intended that all the units would be utilised for the provision of social housing for existing tenants and applicants from the Social Housing list supporting the 'Rebuilding Ireland Plan' as approved by government in 2016.

At the time of the proposal, there were 818 approved housing applicants for social housing on Cork City Council's waiting list with their preference for the City Centre area.

Cork City Council looks to provide secure, good quality housing responding to the current and future needs for social housing, while also ensuring value for money for taxpayers, by following the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government's guidance document, Quality Housing for Sustainable Communities and subscribing to the following principles when designing developments;

- Socially and environmentally appropriate;
- Architecturally appropriate;
- Accessible and adaptable;
- Safe, secure and healthy;
- Affordable;
- Durable; and
- Resource efficient

The Boyce's Street/Cattle Market Street Project like all public-funded construction projects must comply with the Capital Works Management Framework (CWMF) as required by the Department of Finance Circular 06/2010. There are four stages of approval, where submissions must be made to the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government for review.

The four stages can be summarised as:

Stage 1: Confirm approval for design expenditure

Stage 2: Assess project prior to statutory approval

Stage 3: Approve detailed design; review pre-tender cost check

Stage 4: Review tender returns in advance of awarding the contract

Cork City Council submitted the Capital Appraisal for Boyce's Street to establish the business case for the development to the DHPLG in November 2016. The project was approved in principle by the DHPLG in January 2017 (Stage 1 approval). A Part 8 Application was made and received Council approval in May 2018.

Following submission of Stage 2, based on consultation with the DHPLG and to ensure value for money was achieved, the contract was split in to two phases, enabling works including the demolition of existing site and the main construction works. Stage 3 of enabling works and Stage 2 of construction works was submitted and subsequently approved by the DHPLG in September 2018 for the overall budget of €16,588,289.29. A revised budget was submitted with the DHPLG setting a recommended budget of €17,019,856.42 in 2019.

In March 2019, the phase known as the 'Decant of Residents' began which is the relocation of residents in stages to allow onsite work to commence. The contract notice for submission of tenders was published in April 2019. Five submissions were received and all tenderers passed the Suitability Assessment Criteria. Each tender was assessed based on their quality score and tender price and an independent assessment was presented to the evaluation panel for consideration. It was recommended that Cumnor Construction Ltd be appointed as Contractor for Enabling Works having been determined to have submitted the most economically advantageous tender.

Stage 4 for the Enabling Works Contract was approved by the DHPLG in August 2019. Work for the enabling phase commenced on site in December 2019 and the works are still ongoing. They had been expected to have been completed in April 2020 however, Covid-19 has brought new challenges and the impact of stopping and restarting enabling works is expected to add 4 months to the schedule with the expected completion date for enabling works now August 2020.

Stage 3 for the construction works is due to be submitted to the DHPLG for approval in August 2020.

The current project work programme has an expected completion date of November 2022. In light of the new working restrictions as a result of Covid-19, there is the potential for additional costs and an extension of timelines which have yet to be determined.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Cork City Council has completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street Project. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the [Public Spending Code](#).

| Objectives | Inputs | Activities | Outputs | Outcomes |
|--|--|---|--|---|
| Deliver new social housing units to support the Housing Strategy 2020 from the DHPLG. | Capital funding provided by the DHPLG. | Capital Appraisal/Proposal. Part 8 Planning process. | The development of 51 dwelling units and a public open space at Boyce's Street, Cork City. | The housing project is expected to deliver the following; |
| Provide housing to meet guidelines for the development of Quality Sustainable Communities. | Site at Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street. | Decant/Relocation of residents. Demolition of existing houses and flats. | | - new social housing units in response to the demand that exists for the Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street area, reducing the numbers on Cork City Council's housing waiting list and supporting the Housing Strategy 2020. |
| | Cork City Council Staff. | Tender process, review, selection and award for each phase. | | |
| | External Consultants & Contractors. | Construction Phase. Monitoring of spend and tracking to budget. | | |

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives: The objective of the housing development is to deliver fifty-one new social housing units to support the Housing Strategy 2020 programme. The construction of these units will contribute towards addressing the housing waiting list and the high demand for suitable housing in the Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street area.

Inputs: The primary input to the programme is the capital funding of €17,019,856.42 approved by the Department of Housing, Planning & Local Government (DHPLG).

Activities: A number of key activities have been carried out to date on the project including;

- Identification of social need through housing applicants waiting lists in the Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street area.
- Part 8 Planning Process
- Preparation of a Proposal (Capital Appraisal)
- Continuous correspondence with DHPLG with submission and approvals for each stage of the process
- Tendering for external contractors, review and award of contracts
- Decant/Relocation of residents
- Demolition of existing houses and flats
- Internal approvals through Chief Executive Order
- Monitoring of spend and tracking of budget
- Project management and administration of contracts

Outputs: The projected outputs from the project will be 51 high quality dwellings with a mix of 37 houses and 14 apartments.

10 - 1-bedroom dwellings

36 - 2-bedroom dwellings

5 – 3-bedroom dwellings

The public open space will have a landscaping upgrade with planting.

Outcomes: As the project is ongoing the outcome is yet to be determined however the anticipated outcome of the project is to deliver new social housing units to support the Housing Strategy 2020 programme. In the Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street area, there is an elevated list of approved housing applicants. These fifty-one units will provide social housing addressing the demand in the area.

The project is also set to deliver an improved quality of social housing units, the housing units will meet the guidelines for the development of Quality Sustainable Communities set out in the DHPLG guidance.

Section B - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

The following section tracks the Housing Development Programme – from inception to date in terms of major project/programme milestones



| | |
|----------------|---|
| 2014 | Social Housing Strategy 2020 & Rebuilding Ireland. |
| November 2016 | Capital Appraisal and DHPLG submission for approval. |
| January 2017 | Stage 1 submission/approval. |
| May 2017 | Quantity Surveyor services/appointment to Part 8. |
| September 2018 | Stage 2 submission/approval. |
| September 2018 | Stage 3 Enabling Works Contract (EWC) Approval. |
| July 2019 | Quantity Surveyor Services Appointment for EWC. |
| July 2019 | PSDP Appointment. |
| August 2019 | PSCS Appointment. |
| August 2019 | Structural & Civil Engineering, Building Services Engineering & Fire Consultancy Services Appointments. |
| August 2019 | DHPLG Stage 4 submission/approval for EWC. |
| August 2019 | Chief Executive Order for EWC. |
| December 2019 | On site commencement of enabling works. |

Section B - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis and evaluation for the Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street Development.

Project/Programme Key Documents

| Title | Details |
|--|--|
| Cork Joint Housing Strategy | Joint Strategy document addressing the existing and future housing needs of the Cork area. |
| Capital Appraisal for Boyce's Street | Appraisal document for the development at Boyce's Street, Cork. |
| Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government | Submissions and Approvals to the Department in line with the Capital Works Management Framework. |
| Tender Documents | Procurement and tender process documents. |
| Chief Executive Orders | Evidence to support the executive approval. |

Key Document 1: Cork Joint Housing Strategy.

Cork County Council and Cork City Council developed a strategy document in order to address the existing and future housing needs of the Cork area. The overarching purpose of a housing strategy is to ensure that the proper planning and sustainable development of the area of the relevant development plan provides for the housing of the existing and future population of the area in an appropriate manner.

Key Document 2: Capital Appraisal for Development of Boyce's Street, Cork.

The appraisal detailed the following;

- Objective – to address the poor quality of housing and public open space in the Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street area.
- Analysis of Housing Need – the need for social housing within the Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street area of Cork City.

- Site Analysis - assessment of the suitability of a site for housing purposes.
- Design Brief – an outline of the proposed development of fifty one dwellings, taking into account the design criteria as outlined in the 2007 DECLG subsequently renamed the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government (DHPLG) ‘Quality Housing for Sustainable Communities’ document and updated 2015 guidelines.
- Project Management Arrangements – details of the mix of in-house and external contractors proposed to complete the project
- Initial Cost Estimates – preliminary budget estimate for the development.
- Risk Analysis – an infestation of Japanese knotweed to be eliminated before the development in Boyce’s Street can proceed.
- Planning and Procurement Strategy – the project will be subject to a Part 8 Planning process. Consultants and Contractors not available in-house will be procured in accordance with the CWMF and the Public Procurement Guidelines.
- Programme – design time, part 8 planning process times, tender period, including tender assessment and standstill period times and construction time.

The Capital Appraisal document was included in Cork City Council’s stage 1 submission to the DHPLG.

Key Document 3: Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government.

The submission and approvals along with the supporting documentation are maintained on the file for the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government approval for the development with a budget of €17,019,856.42.

There are four stages of approval, where submissions must be made to the Department of Housing, Planning, and Local Government for review.

The four stages can be summarised as;

Stage 1: Confirm approval for design expenditure

Stage 2: Assess project prior to statutory approval

Stage 3: Approve detailed design; review pre-tender cost check

Stage 4: Review tender returns in advance of awarding the contract

As can be common in large scale projects, this contract was split into two phases between enabling works, including demolition and the main construction works following Stage 2 Approval from the DHPLG.

Cork City Council submitted all documentation to the department to support their capital grant claims to date.

Key Document 4: Tender Documents

In addition to the enabling works contractor, the construction works required a full design team including Structural and Civil Engineering, Building Services Engineering and Fire Consultancy Services, Quantity Surveyor Services and Project Supervisor Services for the Design Process and Construction Stage led by the City Architect's Department. An open procedure was selected as the appropriate procurement procedure.

Based on the scale of the project and the estimated cost, the Contract Notices for Project Supervisor for the Construction Stage, Quantity Surveyor for the Construction Works and Structural & Civil Engineering, Building Services Engineering and Fire Consultancy Services were uploaded on e-tenders.

Submissions for contracts were received and assessed by the assessment panels and recommendations were made for the appointment.

Comprehensive documentation relating to the tender evaluation processes and subsequent reports and recommendation to appoint contractors are available on file.

Key Document 5: Chief Executive Orders

The following Chief Executive Order's were reviewed as part of the in-depth review:

- The appointment of Deasy Walley Partnership for the provision of additional Quantity Surveying Services for Stage (ii) Part 8 Planning Design on 04/05/17
- The appointment of KCH Ltd for refurbishment works on the 27/08/18
- The appointment of Seán Galvin for Refurbishment works on 04/03/19
- The appointment of Tony O'Regan Associates for the Quantity Surveying Services for enabling works on the 17/04/19
- The appointment of Punch Consulting Engineers for the provision of PSDP Services for construction on 26/07/19
- The appointment of Punch Consulting Engineers for the provision of Structural & Civil Engineering & Fire Consultancy Services on the 08/08/19

- The appointment of Cumnor Construction Ltd for the Enabling Works Contract on the 22/08/19
- The appointment of Harris Coyle Breen QS for the provision of Quantity Surveyor Consultancy Services for 51 Housing Units, Main Works Contract at Upper Cattle Market Street/Boyce's Street on 23/08/19.

Section B - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the Boyce's Street Development Project. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project.

| Data Required | Use | Availability |
|--|---|---|
| Cork City Council Housing Waiting List | To determine the demand for the area | This is available from the Housing Section of Cork City Council |
| Project File | Documents to support the process followed throughout the project - preliminary appraisals, meeting minutes, communication with DHPLG, tender reports, Chief Executive Orders, etc | Information readily available – Available on file |
| Costs associated with the project | To determine the value of the project | Information readily available – Available on file |

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

The files that were reviewed were of a high quality and contained all relevant information. All associated costs of the project are clearly identified and can be traced back to the financial management system. The project may also be subject to audits/checks by the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government since they are the sanctioning body.

As per the table above, it should be feasible to determine the data required to evaluate the project's future success. However this project is not yet complete and will require several years to fully embed and to evaluate if its core strategic objectives have been met.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the development of Boyce's Street/Upper Cattlemarket Street based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

Based on the in-depth review undertaken, it appears that the development of Boyce's Street/Upper Cattlemarket Street is substantially in compliance with the Public Spending Code. The development has been conducted in line with the requirements of the Sanctioning Authority which in this case is the Department of Housing, Planning, Community and Local Government. Cork City Council has a clear and transparent procurement process. Cork City Council has had clear communication with the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government to ensure that approvals were sought at the necessary stages before expenditure commenced. All recommendations set by the Department to date have been addressed and met where required. It is considered that the project has been well managed during the planning, tender and design phases and that there is appropriate oversight and management in the current enabling works phase.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

All information and supporting documents requested during the audit were provided and are maintained and would be readily available for a full evaluation at a later date. There is sufficient data and information available on file and through the financial management system to ensure that the project can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date. Financial information is easily obtained through Cork City Council financial management system – JD Edwards. There is a clear audit trail on the file from appraisal, tendering, project management and approvals.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

With regard to the Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street development project it is important that the project continues to operate within the Public Spending Code framework. Once the project is complete a post project review should be undertaken within a reasonable timeframe, as per Public Spending Code requirement, to assess whether project objectives have been met and that lessons learned can be applied.

Taking into account the movement and transfer of staff arising from the boundary extension of Cork City Council, it is recommended that staff are made aware of or refreshed on the principles and procedures of the Public Spending Code and the importance of compliance with the Code.

Taking into account Covid-19, the project should be re-evaluated to ensure that any potential additional costs or overruns are identified and relevant measures are put in place.

Section: In-Depth Check Summary

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the Boyce's Street Development Project.

Summary of In-Depth Check

The project involves the development of fifty-one dwelling units in Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street, Cork with an approved overall budget of €17,019,856.42. The site was demolished and redeveloped. This was decided as the optimum solution following input from the Quantity Surveyor regarding the costs involved. This resulted in maximum density, with 10 new larger units replacing the four demolished. An application for capital funding for the project was made to the Department of Housing, Planning, Community and Local Government and is progressing through each stage as set out by the Capital Works Management Framework. The application process is aligned and consistent with the requirements of the Public Spending Code, the Capital Works Management Framework, Public Financial Procedures and EU and National Procurement Requirements. All relevant documentation was made available during this review and is accessible for future evaluation of the project. Works commenced on site in December 2019 and is due for completion in 2023. Covid-19 and subsequent work stoppages and restrictions is likely to have an impact on the completion date for this project and may result in additional costs.

Overall, the capital expenditure project being incurred – Boyce's Street/Upper Cattle Market Street Development Project is well managed and it is reasonable to conclude that Cork City Council is in compliance with the Public Spending Code.

Finally to ensure that the project fully fulfils its obligations under the Public Spending Code, Internal Audit recommends that a post-project review should be completed within a reasonable timeframe once the project is complete.

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme or Project Information

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Name | City Northwest Quarter Regeneration Phase 2A Housing Project |
| Detail | Capital investment programme to develop social housing units in Knocknaheeny, Cork. |
| Responsible Body | Cork City Council |
| Current Status | Expenditure being incurred |
| Start Date | January 2016 |
| End Date | July 2020 |

Overall Cost

€11,852,988.31

Project Description

The City Northwest Quarter Regeneration (CNWQR) is a major programme of public investment by the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government (DHPLG), administered by Cork City Council in the northwest area of Cork City. It involves the demolition of 450 houses and their replacement by 656 new housing units as well as a range of social, environmental and economic interventions. A comprehensive rolling programme of demolition and replacement housing of the highest standard was agreed to be undertaken by Cork City Council and the community to meet the needs of the existing community as well as providing for a more balanced, sustainable community in to the future.

At June 2015, when the CNWQR Phase 2A was appraised, there were over 8,000 applicants on the housing waiting list for Cork City.

The Cork City Development Plan 2015 – 2021 states the following objectives in relation to the CNWQR:

- To create a regenerated quarter in the North West with associated services and recreational amenities;
- To restructure the housing provision to provide good quality housing and create a better balance of dwelling type and tenure;
- To improve accessibility and transport;
- To improve the physical environment of the neighbourhood and enhance its image;
- To evaluate the needs of the community in employment, education initiatives, and community development and facilities;
- To combat crime and anti-social behaviour, and enhance the sense of security.

Cork City Council looks to provide secure, good quality housing responding to the current and future needs for social housing, while also ensuring value for money for taxpayers, by following the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government's guidance document, Quality Housing for Sustainable Communities and subscribing to the following principles when designing developments;

- Socially and environmentally appropriate;
- Architecturally appropriate;
- Accessible and adaptable;
- Safe, secure and healthy;
- Affordable;
- Durable; and
- Resource efficient

The CNWQR programme is carried out over a number of different phases. This review we will focus on Phase 2A.

Phase 2A involves the development of forty-seven dwellings, consisting of thirty-two houses and fifteen apartments at Knocknaheeny, Cork. It is intended that all the units will be social housing for applicants from the Social Housing list supporting the 'Rebuilding Ireland Plan' as approved by government in 2016.

The CNWQR Phase 2A Project like all public-funded construction projects must comply with the Capital Works Management Framework (CWMF) as required by the Department of Finance Circular 06/2010. There are four stages of approval, where submissions must be made to the DHPLG for review.

The four stages can be summarised as:

- Stage 1: Confirm approval for design expenditure
- Stage 2: Assess project prior to statutory approval
- Stage 3: Approve detailed design; review pre-tender cost check
- Stage 4: Review tender returns in advance of awarding the contract

Cork City Council submitted the Capital Appraisal for CNWQR Phase 2A to establish the business case for the development to the DHPLG in January 2016. The contract was split into three phases including Decant, Enabling and Design & Construction. All three phases have separate budgets. This project is focusing on the expenditure for the Design and Construction Phase. Stage 1 Approval for Design and Construction was received by the Department in June 2016.

In September 2016, Stage 2 Approval for Design and Construction with an overall budget of €10,379,750 was received from the Department. The contract notice for the Consulting

Engineering Services was published on the Tenders Electronic Daily (TED) website and e-tenders in July 2016. Eight submissions were received with five tenderers passing the Suitability Assessment Criteria. It was recommended that Atkins be awarded the contract for Engineering Consultancy Services it was determined to be the Most Economically Advantageous Tender.

In September 2016, Reddy Architecture & Urbanism were appointed as the Project Supervisor for the Design Process (PSDP) being determined as having submitted the Most Economically Advantageous Tender. In December 2016, the Housing Agency was appointed for the provision of all Quantity Surveying Services from inception to completion, including the preparation of all tender documentation, including bills of quantities under a shared services agreement with Cork City Council.

Stage 3 Approval for Design and Construction was received from the DHPLG in September 2017. Stage 4 Approval for Design and Construction was received from the Department in February 2018 with an overall budget of €11,827,988.32. The recommendation of Murnane & O'Shea Ltd. was accepted as the main work contractor for the project following a competitive tendering process where seven tenders were received. All tenderers passed the Suitability Assessment Criteria. Murnane & O'Shea submitted the Most Economically Advantageous tender which is competitively priced in accordance with requirements of the tendering process and were awarded the contract in February 2018. Work began on site in May 2018 and the project was completed in July 2020.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Cork City Council has completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the CNWQR Phase 2A Project. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the [Public Spending Code](#).

| Objectives | Inputs | Activities | Outputs | Outcomes |
|--|--|--|--|--|
| Deliver new social housing units to support the Housing Strategy 2020 from the DHPLG. | Capital funding provided by the DHPLG. | Capital Appraisal/Proposal. | The development of 47 dwelling units and a public open space at Knocknaheeny, Cork City. | The housing project is expected to deliver the following; |
| Provide housing to meet guidelines for the development of Quality Sustainable Communities. | Site at Harbour View Road, Knocknaheeny. | Tender process, review, selection and award. | Construction Phase. | - new social housing units in response to the demand that exists for the Knocknaheeny area, reducing the numbers on Cork City Council's housing waiting list and supporting the Housing Strategy 2020. |
| | Cork City Council Staff. | Monitoring of spend and tracking to budget. | | |
| | External Consultants & Contractors. | | | |

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives: The objective of the housing development is to deliver forty-seven new social housing units to support the Housing Strategy 2020 programme. The construction of these units will contribute towards addressing the housing waiting list and the high demand for suitable housing in the Harbour View Rd, Knocknaheeny area.

Inputs: The primary input to the programme is the capital funding of €11,852,988.32 approved by the Department of Housing, Planning & Local Government.

Activities: There were a number of key activities carried out throughout the project including;

- Identification of social need through housing applicants waiting lists in the Knocknaheeny area.
- Part 8 Planning Process
- Preparation of a Proposal (Capital Appraisal)
- Continuous correspondence with DHPLG with submission and approvals for each stage of the process
- Tendering for external contractors, review and award of contracts
- Internal approvals through Chief Executive Order
- Monitoring of spend and tracking of budget
- Project management and administration of contracts

Outputs: The output from the project is forty-seven high quality social and voluntary residential units with a mix of 2 and 3 storey houses, duplexes and apartments.

10 - 2-bedroom dwellings

37 - 3-bedroom dwellings

The public open space has had a landscaping upgrade.

Outcomes: The main outcome of the project is to deliver new social housing units to support the Housing Strategy 2020 programme. In the Knocknaheeny area, there is an elevated list of approved housing applicants. These forty-seven units will provide social housing addressing the demand in the area.

The project also set to deliver an improved quality of social housing units, the housing units will meet the guidelines for the development of Quality Sustainable Communities set out in the DHPLG guidance.

As the development was recently completed in July 2020, a review of the outcomes was not fully considered for this in-depth check.

Section B - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

The following section tracks the Housing Development Programme – CNWQR – Phase 2A from inception to date in terms of major project/programme milestones



| | |
|-----------------------|--|
| 2014 | Social Housing Strategy 2020 & Rebuilding Ireland |
| Jan 2016 | Capital Appraisal |
| June 2016 | Stage 1 Approval for Design and Construction |
| September 2016 | Stage 2 Approval for Design and Construction |
| September 2016 | Appointment of Consulting Engineering Services and Assigned Certifier |
| September 2016 | Appointment of Project Supervisor for the Design Process (PSDP) |
| November 2016 | Appointment of Fire Safety Consultancy Services |
| December 2016 | Appointment of the Housing Agency for the Provision of Quantity Surveying Services |
| March 2017 | Appointment of Landscape Design Services |
| September 2017 | Stage 3 Approval for Design and Construction |
| February 2018 | Stage 4 Approval for Design and Construction |
| February - April 2018 | Contractor tender/appointment for the construction of 47 housing units |
| April 2018 | Appointment of Project Supervisor for the Construction Stage (PSCS) |
| May 2018 | On site commencement |
| July 2020 | Completion date |

Section B - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis and evaluation for the CNWQR – Phase 2A Housing Project.

Project/Programme Key Documents

| Title | Details |
|--|--|
| Cork Joint Housing Strategy | Joint Strategy document addressing the existing and future housing needs of the Cork area. |
| Cork City Development Plan 2015 - 2021 | Document addressing the existing and future housing needs in relation to CNWQR. |
| Capital Appraisal for CNWQR Phase 2A | Appraisal document for the development at Knocknaheeny, Cork. |
| Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government | Submissions and Approvals to the Department in line with the Capital Works Management Framework. |
| Tender Documents | Procurement and tender process documents. |
| Chief Executive Orders | Evidence to support the executive approval. |

Key Document 1: Cork Joint Housing Strategy.

Cork County Council and Cork City Council developed a strategy document in order to address the existing and future housing needs of the Cork area. The overarching purpose of a housing strategy is to ensure that the proper planning and sustainable development of the area of the relevant development plan provides for the housing of the existing and future population of the area in an appropriate manner.

Key Document 2: Cork City Development Plan 2015 – 2021.

The City Development Plan is Cork City Council's main strategic planning policy document and it will guide the future development of the city between now and 2021. This document addresses the existing and future housing needs in relation to CNWQR.

Key Document 3: Capital Appraisal for Development of CNWQR Phase 2A.

The appraisal detailed the following;

- Analysis of Housing Need – the need for social housing within the Knocknaheeny area of Cork City.
- Design Brief – an outline of the proposed use of the site and for the development of the dwellings, taking into account the design criteria as outlined in accordance with the CNWQR 'Design Code and Public Realm Strategy'.
- Site Selection – assessment of the suitability of a site for housing purposes.
- Project Management Arrangements – details of the mix of in-house and external contractors proposed to complete the project
- Initial Cost Estimates – preliminary budget estimate for the development.

The Capital Appraisal document was included in Cork City Council's stage 1 submission to the DHPLG.

Key Document 4: Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government (DHPLG).

The submission and approvals along with the supporting documentation are maintained on the file for the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government approval for the development with a budget of €11,852,988.31.

Cork City Council submitted Milestone Progress reports to the department to support their capital grant claims.

Key Document 5: Tender Documents.

A full design team led by the City Architect's Department, including a Civil & Structural Engineer, Mechanical & Electrical Engineer, Quantity Surveyor, PSDP, Design and Assigned Certifier and Fire Consultant was required for this project. The tender process was structured to allow for one lead consultant to be appointed. This lead consultant was responsible for the performance of the appointed consultancy team. An open procedure was selected as the appropriate strategy. The appropriate Capital Works Management

Framework documents were used, with the awarding of the contract going to the Most Economically Advantageous Tender.

The main works contract was procured in accordance with the CWMF and Public Procurement Guidelines. This contract was advertised on e-tenders. Submissions for this contract were received and assessed by the assessment panels and recommendations were made for the appointment.

Comprehensive documentation relating to the tender evaluation processes and subsequent reports and recommendation to appoint contractors are available on file.

Key Document 6: Chief Executive Orders.

The following Chief Executive Order's were reviewed as part of the in-depth review:

- The appointment of WS Atkins for Consulting Engineering Services, including Structural and Civil Engineering, Building Services Engineering and Design and Assigned Certifier on the 30/09/2016.
- The appointment of Reddy Architecture & Urbanism as the Project Supervisor for the Design Process (PSDP) on the 30/09/2016.
- The appointment of DMA Consulting Engineers Ltd for the provision of Fire Safety Consultancy Services on the 18/11/2016.
- The appointment of the Housing Agency for the provision of Quantity Surveying Services under a Shared Services Arrangement on the 12/12/2016.
- The appointment of Green White Design Studio for the provision of Landscape Design Services on the 06/03/2017.
- The appointment of Murnane O'Shea Ltd. for the construction of 47 Housing units and associated site works on the 18/04/2018.
- The appointment of Murnane O'Shea Ltd. as the Project Supervisor for the Construction Stage (PSCS) for the construction of 47 Housing units and associated site works on the 18/04/2018.

Section B - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the CNWQR Phase 2A Housing Project. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project.

| Data Required | Use | Availability |
|--|--|---|
| Cork City Council Housing Waiting List | To determine the demand for the area | This is available from the Housing Section of Cork City Council |
| Project File | Documents to support the process followed throughout the project - preliminary appraisals, meeting minutes, communication with DHPLG, tender reports, Chief Executive Orders, etc. | Information readily available – Available on file |
| Costs associated with the project | To determine the value of the project | Information readily available – Available on file. |

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

The files that were reviewed were of a high quality and contained all relevant information. All associated costs of the project are clearly identified and can be traced back to the financial management system. The project may also be subject to audits/checks by the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government since they are the sanctioning body.

As per the table above, it should be feasible to determine the data required to evaluate the project's future success. However this project is not yet complete and will require several years to fully embed and to evaluate if its core strategic objectives have been met.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the development of CNWQR Phase 2A Housing Project based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

Based on the in-depth review undertaken, it appears that the development of CNWQR Phase 2A is substantially in compliance with the Public Spending Code. The development has been conducted in line with the requirements of the Sanctioning Authority which in this case is the Department of Housing, Planning, Community and Local Government. Cork has a clear and transparent procurement process. Cork City Council has had clear communication with the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government to ensure that approvals were sought at the necessary stages before expenditure commenced. All recommendations set by the Department were addressed and met where required. It is considered that the project has been well managed during the planning, tender and design phases and that there is appropriate oversight in the current construction submission.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

All information and supporting documents requested during the audit were provided and are maintained and would be readily available for a full evaluation at a later date. There is sufficient data and information available on file through the financial management system and allocations reporting to ensure that the project can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date. Financial information is easily obtained through Cork City Council financial management system – JD Edwards. There is a clear audit trail on the file from appraisal, tendering, project management and approvals.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

Initial completion date was February 2020. In light of new working restrictions as a result of Covid-19 the actual date of completion was 06/07/2020. This project should be re-evaluated to ensure that any potential additional costs or overruns are identified.

Taking into account the movement and transfer of staff arising from the boundary extension of Cork City Council, it is recommended that staff are made aware of or refreshed on the principles and procedures of the Public Spending Code and the importance of compliance with the Code.

Section: In-Depth Check Summary

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the CNWQR Phase 2A Development Project.

Summary of In-Depth Check

The project involves the development of 47 dwelling units in Knocknaheeny, Cork with an approved overall budget of €11,852,988.31. The site was demolished and redeveloped. An application for capital funding for the project was made to the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government and progressed through each stage. This development Phase 2A is part of the Cork Northwest Quarter Regeneration (CNWQR). It includes for the decant of Phase 2A residents to Phase 1B. The houses vacated by this decant in the Phase 2A area were demolished with 47 residential units constructed here. The application process is aligned and consistent with the requirements of the Public Spending Code, the Capital Works Management Framework, Public Financial Procedures and EU and National Procurement Requirements. All relevant documentation was made available during this review and is accessible for future evaluation of the project.

The main contract work commenced on site in May 2018. Initial completion date was February 2020. In light of Covid-19 and subsequent work stoppages and restrictions had an impact on the completion date for this project. The actual completion date for this project was July 2020.

Overall, the capital expenditure project being incurred – CNWQR Phase 2A Development Project is well managed and it is reasonable to conclude that Cork City Council is in compliance with the Public Spending Code.

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme or Project Information

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Name | City Northwest Quarter Regeneration Phase 2B Housing Project |
| Detail | Capital investment programme to develop social housing units in Knocknaheeny, Cork. |
| Responsible Body | Cork City Council |
| Current Status | Expenditure being incurred |
| Start Date | October 2016 |
| End Date | Expected Completion Date of May 2022. |

Overall Cost

€10,125,873.52

Project Description

The Cork Northwest Quarter Regeneration (CNWQR) is a major programme of public investment by the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government (DHPLG), administered by Cork City Council in the northwest area of Cork City. It involves the demolition of 450 houses and their replacement by 656 new housing units as well as a range of social, environmental and economic interventions. A comprehensive rolling programme of demolition and replacement housing of the highest standard was agreed to be undertaken by Cork City Council and the community due to the serious shortcomings in the existing properties and the need to plan for the future.

The Cork City Development Plan 2015 – 2021 states the following objectives in relation to the CNWQR:

- To create a regenerated quarter in the North West with associated services and recreational amenities;
- To restructure the housing provision to provide good quality housing and create a better balance of dwelling type and tenure;
- To improve accessibility and transport;
- To improve the physical environment of the neighbourhood and enhance its image;
- To evaluate the needs of the community in employment, education initiatives, and community development and facilities;
- To combat crime and anti-social behaviour, and enhance the sense of security.

Cork City Council looks to provide secure, good quality housing responding to the current and future needs for social housing, while also ensuring value for money for taxpayers, by following the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government (DHPLG)'s guidance document, Quality Housing for Sustainable Communities and subscribing to the following principles when designing developments;

- Socially and environmentally appropriate;

- Architecturally appropriate;
- Accessible and adaptable;
- Safe, secure and healthy;
- Affordable;
- Durable; and
- Resource efficient

The CNWQR programme is carried out over a number of different Phases. This review will focus on Phase 2B.

This project is for the development of thirty-eight dwellings, with a mix of two and three storey houses, duplexes or apartments at Knocknaheeny, Cork. The site is occupied by five residential blocks of thirty dwellings that require demolition and decanting to facilitate the construction of Phase 2B. It is intended that all the units would be utilised for the existing tenants and for the provision of social housing for applicants from the Social Housing list supporting the 'Rebuilding Ireland Plan' as approved by government in 2016.

The CNWQR Phase 2B Project like all public-funded construction projects must comply with the Capital Works Management Framework (CWMF) as required by the Department of Finance Circular 06/2010. There are four stages of approval, where submissions must be made to the DHPLG for review.

The four stages can be summarised as:

Stage 1: Confirm approval for design expenditure

Stage 2: Assess project prior to statutory approval

Stage 3: Approve detailed design; review pre-tender cost check

Stage 4: Review tender returns in advance of awarding the contract

Cork City Council submitted the Capital Appraisal for CNWQR Phase 2B to establish the business case for the development to the DHPLG in October 2016. The project was approved in principle by the Department in January 2017(Stage 1 approval). A Part 8 Application was made and received Council approval in October 2018.

In November 2017, the phase known as the 'Decant of Residents' began which is the relocation of residents in stages to allow onsite work to commence.

A revised stage 4 approval for the Demolition and Landscaping works was received from the DHPLG in March 2018. McSweeney Plant Hire & Demolition were awarded the Demolition and Landscaping contract as the most economically advantageous tender in January 2018 but withdrew their tender in March 2018. O'Kelly Bros Engineering Ltd. was the 2nd most economically advantageous tender and was awarded the Demolition and Landscaping contract in April 2018. Works began on site in April 2018.

In May 2018, Stage 2 Approval with an overall budget of €10,125,873.52 was received from the Department.

Stage 3 Construction Submission is currently being drafted for submission to the DHPLG. The start date is subject to Stage 3 Approval and successful tendering process. The estimated start date is September 2020. The current project work programme was originally for 18 months. In light of new working restrictions as a result of Covid-19, there is the potential for additional costs and an extension of these timelines. At the time of the audit there was not a definitive conclusion of what the final impact would be but it is expected that the original completion date would be extended by a minimum of 6 months.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Cork City Council has completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the CNWQR Phase 2B Project. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the [Public Spending Code](#).

| Objectives | Inputs | Activities | Outputs | Outcomes |
|--|---|--|---|--|
| Deliver new social housing units to support the Housing Strategy 2020 from the DHPLG. | Capital funding provided by the DHPLG. | Capital Appraisal/Proposal Part 8 Planning process | The development of 38 dwelling units in Knocknaheeny, Cork City. | The housing project is expected to deliver the following; |
| Provide housing to meet guidelines for the development of Quality Sustainable Communities. | Site at Harbour View Road, Knocknaheeny. Cork City Council Staff. External Consultants & Contractors. | Decanting Tender Process, review, selection and award Demolition and Landscaping Construction Phase Monitoring of spend and tracking to budget | Demolition of existing dwellings within Phase 2B and landscaping of the area. Low quality housing units built in the 1970's will be replaced by new units superior in terms of energy usage and emission generation. | - new social housing units in response to the demand that exists for the Knocknaheeny area, reducing the numbers on Cork City Council's housing waiting list and supporting the Housing Strategy 2020. |

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives: The objective of the housing development is to deliver thirty-eight new social housing units to support the Housing Strategy 2020 programme. The construction of these units will contribute towards addressing the housing waiting list and the high demand for suitable housing in the Harbour View Rd, Knocknaheeny area.

Inputs: The primary input to the programme is the capital funding approved by the Department of Housing, Planning & Local Government.

Activities: There were a number of key activities carried out throughout the project including;

- Identification of social need through housing applicants waiting lists in the Knocknaheeny area.
- Part 8 Planning Process
- Preparation of a Proposal (Capital Appraisal)
- Continuous correspondence with DHPLG with submission and approvals for each stage of the process
- Tendering for external contractors, review and award of contracts
- Internal approvals through Chief Executive Order
- Monitoring of spend and tracking of budget
- Project management and administration of contracts

Outputs: The projected outputs from the project will be 38 high quality dwellings with a mix of 2 and 3 storey houses, duplexes and apartments.

17 - 2-bedroom dwellings

19 - 3-bedroom dwellings

2 – 4-bedroom dwelling

The demolition of vacated units within Phase 2B and the landscaping of the area followed by the construction of the Phase 2B new build homes.

Outcomes: The main outcome of the project is to deliver new social housing units to support the Housing Strategy 2020 programme. In the Knocknaheeny area, there is an elevated list of approved housing applicants. These 38 units will provide social housing addressing the demand in the area.

The project also set to deliver an improved quality of social housing units, the housing units will meet the guidelines for the development of Quality Sustainable Communities set out in the DHPLG guidance.

Section B - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

The following section tracks the Housing Development Programme – CNWQR – Phase 2B from inception to date in terms of major project/programme milestones



| | |
|----------------------|---|
| 2014 | Social Housing Strategy 2020 & Rebuilding Ireland |
| October 2016 | Capital Appraisal and DHPLG submission for approval |
| January 2017 | Stage 1 Approval |
| July 2017 | Appointment of consultant to prepare AA and EIA screening reports |
| March 2018 | Stage 4 Approval for the Demolition & Landscaping works contract |
| May 2018 | Stage 2 Approval |
| July 2018 | Quantity Surveyor tender/appointment to Part 8 |
| July 2019 | Engineering and Fire Consultancy appointment |
| July 2019 | PSDP Appointment Post Part 8 |
| August 2019 | Chief Executive Order |
| Expected - Sept 2020 | On site commencement |

Section B - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis and evaluation for the CNWQR – Phase 2B Housing Project.

Project/Programme Key Documents

| Title | Details |
|--|--|
| Cork Joint Housing Strategy | Joint Strategy document addressing the existing and future housing needs of the Cork area. |
| Cork City Development Plan 2015 - 2021 | Document addressing the existing and future housing needs in relation to CNWQR. |
| Capital Appraisal for CNWQR Phase 2B | Appraisal document for the development at Knocknaheeny, Cork. |
| Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government | Submissions and Approvals to the Department in line with the Capital Works Management Framework. |
| Tender Documents | Procurement and tender process documents. |
| Chief Executive Orders | Evidence to support the executive approval. |

Key Document 1: Cork Joint Housing Strategy.

Cork County Council and Cork City Council developed a strategy document in order to address the existing and future housing needs of the Cork area. The overarching purpose of a housing strategy is to ensure that the proper planning and sustainable development of the area of the relevant development plan provides for the housing of the existing and future population of the area in an appropriate manner.

Key Document 2: Cork City Development Plan 2015 – 2021.

The City Development Plan is Cork City Council's main strategic planning policy document and it will guide the future development of the city between now and 2021. This document addresses the existing and future housing needs in relation to CNWQR.

Key Document 3: Capital Appraisal for Development of CNWQR Phase 2B.

The appraisal detailed the following;

- Analysis of Housing Need – the need for social housing within the Knocknaheeny area of Cork City.
- Design Brief – an outline of the proposed use of the site and for the development of the dwellings, taking into account the design criteria as outlined in accordance with the CNWQR 'Design Code and Public Realm Strategy'.
- Site Selection – assessment of the suitability of a site for housing purposes.
- Project Management Arrangements – details of the mix of in-house and external contractors proposed to complete the project
- Initial Cost Estimates – preliminary budget estimate for the development.
- Planning and Procurement Strategy – It is proposed that Phase 2B is designed to a Part 8 Planning application format.
- Programme – includes block up vacant properties, secure area and disconnect utilities, design time, part 8 planning process time including demolition and landscaping, tender period including demolition and landscaping, works including demolition and landscaping and construction of housing, standstill period times due to Covid-19.

The Capital Appraisal document was included in Cork City Council's stage 1 submission to the DHPLG.

Key Document 4: Correspondence with the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government

The submission and approvals along with the supporting documentation are maintained on the file for the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government approval for the development with a budget of €10,125,873.52. Cork City Council submitted Milestone Progress reports to the department to support their capital grant claims.

Key Document 5: Tender Documents

The design and construction of this project is managed by the CNWQR Project Team. The City Council's Architects Department will head up the Design team to bring the project to a suitable standard for Part 8 Planning.

Demolition and Landscaping works contract was procured in accordance with the CWMF and Public Procurement Guidelines. This contract was advertised on e-tenders.

Submissions for this contract were received and assessed by the assessment panels and recommendations were made for the appointment. Submissions for contracts were received and assessed by the assessment panels and recommendations were made for the appointments of consultancy services and sub-consultants, Architect Led Design Team, Post Part 8, Geotechnical and Environmental Consultants, based on the lowest accepted tender, in accordance with the CWMF Standard Conditions of Engagement for Construction Consultants.

Comprehensive documentation relating to the tender evaluation processes and subsequent reports and recommendation to appoint contractors are available on file.

Key Document 6: Chief Executive Orders

The following Chief Executive Order's were reviewed as part of the in-depth review:

- The appointment of Harry Walsh Planning for the provision of consulting services for Demolition and Landscaping on 03/07/17.
- The appointment of Conhor Construction Ltd for CNWQR Phase 2B vacant unit works. Stage 2 on 12/02/18.
- The appointment of O'Kelly Bros Civil Engineering Company Ltd for the Phase 2B Demolition and Landscaping on 09/04/18.
- The appointment of DTA Architects as the design team for the Post Part 8 design of Phase 2B of CNWQR on 13/05/19.
- The appointment of Linesight Shaw Safety Management as the Project Supervisor for the Design Process (PSDP) Post Part 8 on the 22/05/19.
- The appointment of Priority Geotechnical Ltd for the provision of site investigation services on 18/09/19.
- The appointment of O'Callaghan Moran Associates for the provision of waste Analysis Services on 19/09/19.
- The appointment of Murphy Surveys Ltd for the provision of Ground Penetrating Radar and to topographical survey for Phases 1C and 2B of the CNWQR on 02/10/19.

Section B - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the CNWQR Phase 2B Housing Project. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project.

| Data Required | Use | Availability |
|--|--|---|
| Cork City Council Housing Waiting List | To determine the demand for the area | This is available from the Housing Section of Cork City Council |
| Project File | Documents to support the process followed throughout the project - preliminary appraisals, meeting minutes, communication with DHPLG, tender reports, Chief Executive Orders, etc. | Information readily available – Available on file |
| Costs associated with the project | To determine the value of the project | Information readily available – Available on file. |

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

The files that were reviewed were of a high quality and contained all relevant information. All associated costs of the project are clearly identified and can be traced back to the financial management system. The project may also be subject to audits/checks by the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government since they are the sanctioning body.

As per the table above, it should be feasible to determine the data required to evaluate the project's future success. However this project is not yet complete and will require several years to fully embed and to evaluate if its core strategic objectives have been met.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the development of CNWQR Phase 2B Housing Project based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

Based on the in-depth review undertaken, it appears that the development of CNWQR Phase 2B is substantially in compliance with the Public Spending Code. The development has been conducted in line with the requirements of the Sanctioning Authority which in this case is the Department of Housing, Planning, Community and Local Government. Cork has a clear and transparent procurement process. Cork City Council has had clear communication with the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government to ensure that approvals were sought at the necessary stages before expenditure commenced. All recommendations set by the Department were addressed and met where required. It is considered that the project has been well managed during the planning, tender and design phases and that there is appropriate oversight in the current construction submission.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

All information and supporting documents requested during the audit were provided and are maintained and would be readily available for a full evaluation at a later date. There is sufficient data and information available on file through the financial management system and allocations reporting to ensure that the project can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date. Financial information is easily obtained through Cork City Council financial management system – JD Edwards. There is a clear audit trail on the file from appraisal, tendering, project management and approvals.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

With regard to the CNWQR Phase 2B housing project it is important that the project continues to operate within the Public Spending Code framework. Once the project is complete a post project review should be undertaken within a reasonable timeframe, as per Public Spending Code requirement, to assess whether project objectives have been met and that lessons learned can be applied. In light of the impact of Covid-19, this project should be re-evaluated to ensure that any potential additional costs or overruns are identified.

Taking into account the movement and transfer of staff arising from the boundary extension of Cork City Council in 2019, it is recommended that staff are made aware of or refreshed on the principles and procedures of the Public Spending Code and the importance of compliance with the Code.

Section: In-Depth Check Summary

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the CNWQR Phase 2B Development Project.

Summary of In-Depth Check

The project involves the development of 38 dwelling units in Knocknaheeny, Cork with an approved overall budget of €10,125,873.52. The site was demolished and redeveloped. An application for capital funding for the project was made to the Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government and progressed through each stage. This development Phase 2B is part of the Cork Northwest Quarter Regeneration (CNWQR). It includes the decant of Phase 2B residents to Phase 1B or alternative housing. The houses vacated by this decant in the Phase 2B area were demolished with 38 residential units constructed here. The CWMF Stage 3 Construction is currently being prepared for submission to the DHPLG. The application process is aligned and consistent with the requirements of the Public Spending Code, the Capital Works Management Framework, Public Financial Procedures and EU and National Procurement Requirements. All relevant documentation was made available during this review and is accessible for future evaluation of the project. The start date for commencement of this project is subject to Stage 3 approval and successful tendering process, is estimated to be September 2020 and the expected completion is 2022.

Overall, the capital expenditure project being incurred – CNWQR Phase 2B Development Project is well managed and it is reasonable to conclude that Cork City Council is in compliance with the Public Spending Code.

Finally to ensure that the project fully fulfils its obligations under the Public Spending Code, Internal Audit recommends that a post-project review should be completed within a reasonable timeframe once the project is complete.

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme or Project Information

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Name | Public Lighting |
| Detail | Revenue expenditure on Public Lighting functions throughout Cork City Council. |
| Responsible Body | Cork City Council |
| Current Status | Expenditure Being Incurred |

Start Date 1st January 2019 (Recurring Annual Expenditure)

End Date 31st December 2019 (Recurring Annual Expenditure)

Overall Cost **€3,737,182**

Project Description

Cork City Council’s Mission Statement is to deliver excellent public services to the people of Cork by working collaboratively with our strategic partners, be a city of ambition, working with our neighbourhoods, communities and businesses to support economic development and facilitate investment and to value our culture and heritage and ensure that Cork continues to be successful as an attractive place to live, study, visit and work.

One public service delivered by Cork City Council is the operation, maintenance and provision of approximately 25,000 public lights throughout the city. Public lights are important for ensuring road safety at night and enhancing the public realm of the city. Public lighting includes street lights, road networks and lights in housing estates that have been taken in charge by Cork City Council. The revenue expenditure in 2019 was € **3,737,182**. The breakdown of this expenditure is outlined in table below:

| Expenditure Analysis | Amount | % Spend |
|---------------------------|---------------------|-------------|
| Energy | 2,397,454.33 | 64% |
| Maintenance & Repair | 1,272,741.49 | 34% |
| Consultancy | 54,418.87 | 1% |
| Miscellaneous Expenditure | 12,567.57 | 0% |
| Total | 3,737,182.26 | 100% |

The main expenditure for public lighting is the cost of the supply of electricity and the maintenance of the public lighting network.

A tender competition for a Multi Supplier Framework Agreement for the Supply of Electricity to Public Bodies was initiated by the Office of Government Procurement (OGP) in February 2015. Based on this framework, the OGP ran competitions for both the provision of metered and unmetered electricity supply and selected national suppliers. Based on this Cork City Council entered into contracts with the following:

- SEE Airtricity Ltd. for the supply of metered electricity from July 2016 to June 2019
- Veridian Energy Ltd., T/A Energia for the supply of unmetered electricity from November 2018 to October 2022

During the period under review, the contract for the supply metered electricity expired. The OGP had established a Dynamic Purchasing System (DPS) in January 2019 to replace the Multi-Supplier Framework Agreement for the supply of electricity to Public Service Bodies and ran a DPS mini-competition for the supply of metered electricity to local authorities in March 2019. The following contract was entered into following the OGP's evaluation and outcome.

- Veridian Energy Ltd., T/A Energia for the supply of metered electricity from July 2019 to June 2022

The maintenance of public lights was undertaken by Airtricity Utility Solutions on behalf of Cork City Council in 2019.

The maintenance of public lighting was awarded to Airtricity Utility Solutions Ltd. following a public procurement process in 2014. The contract was signed in October 2014 to March 2019.

Cork City Council reserved the right to extend the term for a period of up to 12 months with a maximum of 2 such extensions permitted. Cork City Council extended the contract and invited tenders for the provision through Etenders in October 2019, running the competition in 2020. The details of this was not included in the scope of this review as it was not yet completed.

Cork City Council uses the DeadSure Public Lighting Asset Management System to manage details of maintenance schedules, repairs, upgrades faults, night patrols, etc. The Deadsure IT Reporting System is a national system and the system has been used for a number of years to monitor all faults and energy usage of public lighting nationally.

Deadsure is used by the council and by the maintenance contractor, but also allows members of the public to report faults with lights. Cork City council's website redirects service users to the Deadsure site for reporting a fault.

A monthly report is available on Deadsure showing work carried out by the contractor which is reconciled with the contractor's invoice before payment is made. Contractor bills are checked against contract terms before payment is made. This review provides assurance that there is a process in place to appraise and monitor the expenditure, satisfying the principles of the public spending code.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Cork City Council has completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for Public Lighting. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the [Public Spending Code](#).

| Objectives | Inputs | Activities | Outputs | Outcomes |
|--|--|---|--|---|
| To maintain and provide public lighting in the city in an energy and cost efficient manner. | Revenue expenditure of €3,737,182 to operate and maintain public lighting. | Tender process for the supply of electricity and for the provision of public lighting maintenance and related services. | Approx. 25,000 lights maintained across Cork City. | Increased safety for road users and pedestrians |
| To improve public safety on road network for all road users. | Staff resource to manage the public lighting programme. | Monitoring of performance of maintenance contractor, ensuring requirements of contracts are met. | An efficient, cost effective and sustainable public lighting system. | A responsive maintenance system where faults and repairs can tracked and monitored. |
| To ensure that housing estates, pathways and public amenity areas are safe and secure and reduce the risk of night time crime. | Contract with SSE Airtricity for maintenance of public lighting. Contract with Energia for unmetered electricity supply and for metered electricity supply. | Processing of payments to third party suppliers and contractors. | Inventory system of all light maintained through Deadsure. | Increased night-time economy. Reduction in energy consumption. |

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives:

Cork City Council is responsible for the provision and maintenance of public lighting within its functional area. The objectives of the programme are the provision of cost-effective public lighting in all areas of Cork City, to ensure that the public lighting strategy aligns with the vision to provide a well designed, well maintained, safe and efficient street lighting system for the people of Cork City and to improve road safety for all road users and enhance public safety. The objective is also to have damaged or faulty public lights repaired as quickly as possible and to use an interactive and transparent system for monitoring repairs.

Inputs:

The primary input to the programme is the annual expenditure of for the supply and maintenance of public lighting and associated staff and administration costs. The budget for 2019 was approved by Cork City council members on the 15th November 2018. The costs are primarily for the energy supply of public lighting paid to the contracted energy suppliers, and to a contractor for the maintenance and repair of the network.

Activities:

The ongoing activities are the periodic tendering for the supply of energy and for the provision of public lighting maintenance and related services. Cork City Council must monitor and manage the supply and maintenance of public lighting to ensure that all services are carried out as per contract and that the payments are processed to suppliers/contractors relating to these activities.

Outputs:

The outputs of the programme are the maintenance of approximately 14,500 lights (25,000 lights post-boundary extension in May 2019)² throughout the city.

Outcomes:

The main outcome of the programme is the provision of a well designed, well maintained, safe and efficient street lighting system for the people of Cork City and enhanced public safety through the provision and maintenance of public lighting. The outcomes concern public quality of life and ease of safe movement in public areas after dark. Where good public lighting is in place, there is an increased activity by people for leisure and other activities and an improved perception of security and safety. The programme also achieves a saving on energy costs for Cork City Council which includes a reduction in energy consumption by utilising LED technology.

² This report primarily focuses on expenditure related to the public lighting inventory for Cork City Council's old inventory pre-boundary extension. The contracts between Cork County Council and third party suppliers for the maintenance of public lighting and electricity supply for the infrastructure acquired in the boundary extension have not been included in the scope of our review.

Section B - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

The Public Lighting programme is annual revenue expenditure, with no project commencement or end dates. The programme falls under the heading of “expenditure being incurred”.

Section B - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis and evaluation for Public Lighting. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the programme.

Project/Programme Key Documents

| Title | Details |
|------------------------------|---|
| Annual Budget 2019 | Details of the approved amount for Public Lighting for coming year. |
| Tender Documents | Documentation for the tendering of the provision of public lighting maintenance. |
| Contract Documents | Contract Documents in place with third parties providing electricity supply and public lighting maintenance. |
| Monthly Reports and Invoices | Reports from Deadsure - details work carried out by maintenance contractor which can be reconciled with invoices. |
| JD Edwards Financial Reports | Reports generated detailing the expenditure and income on the relevant job codes |

Key Document 1: Annual Budget 2019

The budget amount of €2,645,400 for Public Lighting was approved by Council at their annual Budget meeting in November 2018. The 2019 budget is broken down as Public Lighting Operating Costs - €1,651,200, Public Lighting Improvements – €963,700 and Service Support Costs €30,500.

Key Document 2: Tender documents for the provision of public lighting maintenance and related services.

An open procedure Tender Competition was initiated by Cork City Council in March 2014 for the provision of Public Lighting Maintenance and Related Services. The Request for Tender was published on Etenders. The process followed National and Cork City Council procurement rules.

Key Document 3: Contracts with Maintenance Contractor and Energy Suppliers

The following contracts were in place during 2019:

- SEE Airtricity Ltd. for the supply of metered electricity from July 2016 to June 2019.
- Veridian Energy Ltd., T/A Energia for the supply of unmetered electricity from November 2018 to October 2022.
- Veridian Energy Ltd., T/A Energia for the supply of metered electricity from July 2019 to June 2022.
- Airtricity Utility Solutions for the maintenance of public lighting in Cork City from October 2014 to 31st March 2019 (with right to extend).

Key Document 4: Monthly Activity Reports Reports from DeadSure system are issued to the engineer responsible for Public Lighting on a monthly basis. Information available includes faults reported; job ticket numbers and works activity.

Key document 5: Financial reports. Reports from the Financial Management System - JD Edwards, are available to monitor expenditure through the relevant job codes

Section B - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for Public Lighting. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project/programme.

| Data Required | Use | Availability |
|---|---|--|
| Financial costs associated with Public Lighting | To assess the financial impact of the scheme | Yes, information available through Financial Management System |
| Tendering Process | To determine whether the correct tendering process was compliant | Yes, information available through E-tenders and the Public Lighting section of Roads Department |
| Contracts | Ensure contracts are in place and are procured in accordance with legislation, policy and procedures. | Yes, information available from the Public Lighting section of Roads Department |
| No. of faults picked up by patrols or reported by others. | Assess if patrols are being carried out to monitor number of faults. | Yes - From Deadsure IT system |
| No. of faults repaired and the timeline of repair | To monitor compliance with Service Level Agreement | Yes- From Deadsure IT system. |

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

The data required for future evaluation of the project is available through the Deadsure Management System, the Financial Management System - JD Edwards and the files and records which are maintained by the the Roads Department of the Council.

Financial Data was available and can be extracted from JDE Edwards Financial Management System and the Council's budget book and will subsequently be available in the Annual Financial Statements.

Reports can be extracted from Deadsure Management system to monitor and evaluate maintenance activities and contractor performance. Hardcopy document of monthly audits performed and reconciliations are kept on file and are available to review.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for Public Lighting based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

This in-depth check has demonstrated that the broad principles of the Public Spending Code guidelines for on-going management of current expenditure were adhered to. The project is in line with the standards. Best value was obtained through a public procurement process and the scopes of the works are clearly defined in the Request for Tender document and contract.

There was evidence of financial and operational monitoring against targets, expectations and budgets by the Public Lighting Unit. Through our discussions, it was determined that management have a good understanding of achieving value for money.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

Yes it is the opinion of Internal Audit that the data and information available can be subjected to a full evaluation in the future as all documents and files are readily available. There is sufficient data available to evaluate the Public lighting programme.

Operational and financial data is available from Deadsure which is used to manage the maintenance and operation of the Public Lights in Cork City. Also monthly reconciliation of invoices is available both electronically and manually. The financial data is available on JD Edwards, the financial management system to carry out a financial evaluation.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

Internal Audit recommends that detailed written policy and procedures be completed for the processes involved in managing the public lighting function. We also recommend that the appropriate resources are available to ensure that robust controls and processes are in place to ensure sufficient oversight of third parties and to protect and maintain public assets.

Cork City Council Roads & Transportation should continue to monitor performance of maintenance contractor using predetermined key performance measures (KPIs) and check lists to ensure the contractor is meeting requirements as set out in the maintenance

contract. It is important that ongoing monitoring and screening process are documented, signed and approved by a designated person of a sufficient authority.

Section: In-Depth Check Summary

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the Public Lighting Unit.

Summary of In-Depth Check

In 2019 the cost of providing Public Lighting was **€3,737,182**. This programme was categorised as current expenditure being incurred in the 2019 public spending code quality assurance inventory listing.

The objective of the Public Lighting Programme is the provision and maintenance of a public lighting system throughout Cork City to enhance public safety.

Internal Audit is satisfied Value for Money is being achieved on the programme as a majority of the expenditure is procured through national and local procurement frameworks.

Internal Audit is satisfied there are robust controls and monitoring in place in relation to the operation of public lighting and that there is sufficient oversight of contractors engaged to carry out public lighting maintenance and services.

On completion of the in-depth review of the Cork City Council's Public Lighting Programme B05, Internal Audit has formed the opinion that this Revenue expenditure programme appears to be broadly/substantially compliant with the relevant requirements of the public spending code.